MEETING MINUTES
WEDNESDAY, MARCH 7, 2018
CHOFFIN CAREER & TECHNICAL CENTER
6:00 P.M.

I. Call to Order – 6:00 p.m.

II. Oath of Office
   A. Attorney Anthony J. Farris, office of the State of Ohio Attorney General administered the oath of office to Dr. John Richard as an Academic Distress Commission member.

III. Roll Call

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>Present</th>
<th>Absent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Barbara Brothers</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. John Richard</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicholas Santucci</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vincent Shivers</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Note Dr. Barbara Brothers resigned)

IV. Approval of March 7, 2018 Agenda
   Note: Without any opposition from Academic Distress Commission members; Mr. Santucci & Mr. Shivers, Dr. Richard moved agenda Item VIII; Brief discussion of the ADC to Item V; (after the approval the agenda.)

Motion by: Nicholas Santucci       Seconded by: Vincent Shivers

Roll Call Vote:
- Dr. John Richard: Yes __x__ No ______
- Nicholas Santucci: Yes __x__ No ______
- Vincent Shivers: Yes __x__ No ______
V. Brief Discussion of the ADC (item was formerly listed as item VIII)
   A. Dr. John Richard introduced himself and provided a brief summary of his professional background: current Deputy Superintendent of the Ohio Department of Education, a former ADC member for both Youngstown and Lorain City Schools; prior to HB 70. Also, as an ODE employee he worked with both districts in the past.

   He addressed recent resignations of the two (2) ADC members and vacancies. Due to the matters, Dr. Richard was appointed as an ADC member and Chairperson. He stated that the Mayor’s Appointee, through conversation with Dr. Brothers may also resign, to date he has not received official documentation and that is being handled by the Mayor’s office.

   As of tonight, there are three (3) ADC members present. The next steps were provided, in communicating with Mayor Jamael “Tito” Brown’s office appointee and the State Superintendent, Paul DeMaria’s appointee as the law calls for. Dr. Richard explained that his role is for the foreseeable future. The intent is to have another appointee in his place until stability occurs in the commission. He also addressed, CEO Mohip as a finalist for another position elsewhere. He explained that he is aware of this and this will not be discussed in any fashion during the meeting. Personnel matters will not be discussed in the public unless the ADC members are in a position of taking a vote. He stated that this situation is common for a district. In the next two to three weeks ODE is sending a review team to Youngstown. Dr. Richard will be involved and looking forward to see this report.

VI. Approval of October 27, 2017 Minutes

   Motion by: Nicholas Santucci                Seconded by: Dr. Richard

   Roll Call Vote:
   Dr. John Richard                Yes  x             No  
   Nicholas Santucci                Yes  x             No  
   Vincent Shivers                Yes  x             No  

VII. Public Comment Period: (5 minutes per person, 30 minutes maximum in total)

   1. Kelly Swiger, Harding Elementary (Math/Science teacher)
      She wanted to address the issue of no instrumental music program at the elementary level.
      Provided statistics in support and the benefit of music program in elementary schools.
   2. Lisa Boyer, Harding Elementary (K-4 Intervention specialist)
      Stated concerns over I.E.P./general education student to teacher ratios in classrooms.
   3. Pamela Abbey; Harding, Paul C. Bunn, Mahoning County High School (TSOL/ELL teacher)
      She voiced concerns with the increase of students from Hurricane Maria over time and resources for EL students.
   4. Tanna Sebrell, Harding elementary (also YSU instructor/5th grade Math/Science teacher since December)
      Concerns over the lack of a uniform, policy-driven, discipline and behavior policies within the classroom and building. Also concerns for basic classroom supplies and resources for classroom.
   5. Geraldine DeWitt; McGuffey elementary (Intervention Specialist)
      Concerns over GRR framework, cross-categorical classification. Class size, student to teacher ratio, professional development time being spent outside of the classroom.
   6. Tina Cvetkovich; Parent of junior (also YCSD Board Member)
      Concerns over band uniforms for East High School. ROTC only being offered at East High School, and the loss of the instrumental music program/city series music concerts.
VIII. Overview and discussion of Youngstown City Schools from CEO Krish Mohip.

A. Dr. Richard opened the floor to Krish Mohip, CEO to provide a budget update and academic overview of the Youngstown City School District. Mr. Mohip thanked the ADC members for the opportunity to present and provided the ADC members with documentation of artifacts to support the presentation. He began by addressing concerns about the district budget spending and acknowledged that there were significant costs this year in spending. He made reference to artifacts presented to the ADC members with the comparison between the October 2016 Five Year Forecast with the Projected October 2021 Five Year Forecast. This year an extra $8 million was spent. He explained the costs were made to fix the severe needs in areas of discipline with the implementation of restorative practices, academic instruction, and instructional framework. There was also the need to expand the opportunities for students by moving the Youngstown Early College to the Ward Building (20 W. Wood Street) which is scheduled to be renovated. Along with a district wide athletic program.

The Mahoning County Educational Service Center also reviewed the financial reports and projected a $16 million surplus in the budget in 2020. There is a plan to recoup the funds back so that the district is in a better financial state than in October 2016. He stated that while remaining fiscally responsible, there are funds available. The district is already seeing shifts and accelerated growth of students’ performance and learning.

He explained the structure needed for academic transformation to occur for accelerated student growth, so new leadership positions were filled. He explained their roles, purpose and the need for transformation to occur. (Refer to PowerPoint slide and artifacts for job descriptions and evaluations) He stated that YCSD needs instructional leaders. As the district strengthens and improves, some of the leadership roles will not be needed. There also has to be a strong comment and belief of Gradual Release of Responsibility (GRR). This is used as standards based and best practice that must happen within the district.

Mohip commented that when he first came into the district, he noticed that the amount of suspensions were too high for the size of the district. A new Code of Conduct was created and released with the support from the teachers and building Deans with proper implementation of Restorative Practices in the school. He stated that we want to help students learn how to behave, rather than remove them from the situation.

Mohip expressed the importance and need of creating a comprehensive curriculum for the district. The areas of focus were: Curriculum, Assessment and Instruction. He explained in detail how this was being done to strengthen the focus areas through the following to support teachers:

- ELA Scope and Sequence
- Instructional Framework
- Gradual Release of Responsibility
- Professional Development
Dr. Richard questioned what was the percentage of teachers that completed curriculum mapping? Mohip responded that the next GRR date scheduled to occur Friday, March 9, 2018. He said that a week from today, 3/7/18 that information would be provided. He referred to the artifacts for examples of curriculum map, scope & sequence that teachers are engaged in. He explained how we needed to measure the success of the District Wide instructional delivery. A chart was provided with the percentages of how well teachers are teaching which was measured by lesson plan and instruction delivery. Weekly feedback is given to teachers from building principals through a product called “Kick up,” which feedback is given directly to the teacher. Currently, 90% of teachers are receiving feedback that is aligned to the instruction and professional development that has been provided this year.

Mohip briefly he spoke of the professional development to support GRR framework implementation. K-8 utilizes Discovery Education, Chaney and East High Schools use ICLE and Youngstown Early College uses Knowledgeworks. He noted that Professional Development is not only offered to teachers, but Instructional Framework Specialist, Assistant Principals and Principals.

He explained and described the Professional Development Pathways for teachers which are:

- Striving Teachers - teachers that need additional help
- Core – majority of teachers
- Teacher Fellows – teachers with more aptitude
- Master Fellows – approximately forty (40) that are showing the most growth and openness to GRR
- Lab Classroom – This is part of a cost savings, with the investment of professional development this year. The district is taking 20-30 teachers to become model classrooms within the school where other teachers can come observe strong instruction.

Dr. Richard stated that he desired a better understanding of the different pathway levels. Is this based upon performance or level of professional development?

Mohip responded that Striving Teachers were based upon recommendations from the teacher’s building principal, which are those that need more support. Core teachers include anyone that was not in any of the other pathway categories. Teacher Fellows was started last year with teachers that were interested in learning about the framework prior to it being rolled out district wide. Master fellows are teacher fellows that showed great expertise in their classrooms and were excited about the framework and want to learn more. Mohip referred to artifacts of the professional development calendar for the year and how they were scheduled.

Mohip explained that at the district leadership level, cycles of learning were created, he commented on what is being done and described how it is utilized at different levels for teacher teams, school teams and leadership teams.
Mohip gave the floor to Linda Yosay, Deputy Chief of Student Services. She provided an overview of the Multi-Tiered Systems of Support (MTSS). The support looks at what does an individual need (refer to PowerPoint presentation and artifacts.) She explained that when a student is in tier I, II or III documentation is required to process the support the student along with the teacher. Then researched based intervention for the student’s support can then be provided in a manner that is needed in student’s classroom.

Mohip continued the presentation and expressed that he wanted to look at the subject areas the district was struggling the most in, which was reading. The focus this year was reading, time was allocated to give more minutes in reading and math. He wanted to give more time to teaching literacy skills which in general literacy skills could be used in multiple subject areas. The hard work is paying off already and hopeful for the end of the year data.

Dr. Richard asked if there was any type of community engagement or volunteers helping with reading and literacy skills? Mohip responded that he pulled away from Project MORE; it was unobtainable to go district-wide. Essentially when it came to intervention time, we wanted to make sure students were with a teacher or high quality programs. ProjectPASS partnership continues with Youngstown State University (YSU). YSU students come in to work with 2nd and 3rd grade students. This has shown great outcomes through the Striving Readers Grant.

Mohip expressed that what the district is doing is difficult and challenging. He is asking for teachers to not only teach but create strong lessons and plans and to deliver those to a challenging population. He thinks that teachers are doing a wonderful job. There are challenges that are still be addressed but when it comes to the type of work, engagement, instructional framework, it is the right one. Mohip emphasized that he has seen it in action as a principal, teacher, chief and now CEO. It works and he is aware it is difficult. There are more supports to teachers along with accountability with the right type of assessments to give teachers what they need as far as understanding the gaps that their students have.

Mohip shared his extreme pride when he views the shifts occurring in the buildings. When you see the engagement, we do have small class sizes in this district. There a very few classes with more than 25 students and many classrooms have only 14-15 students. We are blessed to have resources to move forward with this type of instructional program. Everything has been built on sustainability. Regardless of changes that may happen outside of the classroom, the district is building sustainable practices so that instruction can continue to grow and flourish. That is why we can show that in four (4) months a 5% increase in reading or ½ percent increase in Math. What we are doing is working, which is based on NWEA assessment.
Timothy Filipovich, Chief of Accountability and Assessment continued the presentation. He referenced the artifacts presented to the ADC members. Specifically, the assessment matrix. The assessment system that is in place so we can see how the students are doing based on strategies that the teachers are implementing. This is the first year that the district has utilized some of these assessments. He explained the different assessments that are being used in Pre-K through the 12th grades both required by the State of Ohio and used for District monitoring (refer to PowerPoint slide and artifacts). He explained the types of assessments which are: diagnostic, formative, summative and progress monitoring.

The data from the assessments are showing tremendous success with some of our teachers that are using the data. In years past, this data did not exist. Now we have it and we know what it is and that it is aligned to the standard. Both teachers and principals are now learning how to understand and utilize that data in an appropriate way.

Filipovich referred to additional artifacts of the district assessment calendar, state testing calendar, samples of score/summary reports and guides for school counselors. He continued to explain the results and scores of the fall and winter NWEA student growth summary report. With the data the district was able to look at student growth from a district level to determine what supports are needed through the focused perspective of the principals, teachers and even the students.

NWEA data can make some predictions on how a student will do on the ACT. Currently, YCSD is utilizing the SAT as the state mandated test. NWEA is forth coming with the same type matrix for the SAT. Filipovich reported that today (3/7/18), approximately 91% of juniors in the district took the SAT.

Filipovich referred to more artifacts that showed the teacher, student and parent tools for support on how to review and use the data. The NWEA data compares students both on the state and national levels. He furthered discussed the results of the DIBELS, which assess basic literacy skills. This is being utilized on the building level.

*Dr. Richard asked if this was the first year that the NWEA map was used, comprehensively. Are there any lessons learned, anything you plan to change moving forward?*

*Filipovich said yes this is the first year. Naturally, the first administration of the test, you can see some misconstrued results because of it being the first time. NWEA helped set guidelines in this regard.*

We are taking the data, helping our teachers utilized it to inform their instruction on how they group kids especially in regards to implementation of the framework. Using data on more a frequent basis and planning out how I can move my kids forward. NWEA targets so well, the teachers are happy with the information they are getting. Filipovich’s said by using the assessment data and statistics, district staff can target more to reach the target of the students’ needs.
Dr. Richard commented that a lot of information was provided and more time would be probably needed to go further. Filipovich responded that yes, but a lot of the same information is being shared with the ODE.

Amanda McGinnis, Deputy Chief of Transformation continued the presentation. Her focus of the presentation was the after school program. She explained that the program is in ten (10) schools, five (5) of those schools receive 21st century grants along with the assistance of strong community partnerships. Detailed data was given of 1,666 students were enrolled in the program receiving three (3) hours of additional academics and enrichment Monday through Thursday. She highlighted the YCSD afterschool program is the largest afterschool program that serves free snack and dinner in the state of Ohio. Between the months of October and January 46,822 snacks and 44,245 dinners were served to students, so that kids would not go home hungry. Academically there was an increase in progress towards meeting the growth target from last year.

She mentioned that this upcoming June for summer school, the assessments that have been talked about will be utilized to determine which students should be encouraged to come to summer school. This is being down in order to prepare them for state testing for 3rd grade reading guarantee, high school courses and credit recovery. In the month of July, academic and enrichment summer camp will take place. This year the camp will be more hands on, I-Ready will not be used.

Dr. Richard asked what were the past enrollment numbers from the past couple of years in the summer school program. McGinnis said that last year, grade levels were targeted to attend summer school program. She would have to get a report back with the exact number. She said at the very beginning last year summer school enrollment there was a high demand for the program.

Dr. Richard thanked McGinnis for the presentation and complimented the great numbers she reported and her enthusiasm.

Greg Kibler, Deputy Chief of Data presented on district accountability for academic growth. Kibler’s background is both academic and data. With this collaboration it allows him to take all the information that was discussed in earlier presentations and bring a focus on student growth. The only way to provide the best is by holding people accountable. In utilizing the data from assessments we are building a strong data culture. This was not done in the past. Kibler continued and provided a detailed overview and process of the use of data in YCSD for Accountability to Academic Growth through the following methods (Refer to PowerPoint slides and artifacts):

5 Week Review System
Teacher Quality Review
Weekly Data Call
Data Walls
Vincent Shivers questioned, how to you determine that a teacher that has been in the district for 30 years is considered skilled, and then all of sudden they are discovered to be developing? How do you measure that?

Kibler responded that every year there are new students and how the teacher addresses these students is a new challenge every year. Sometimes they are better apt to handle that child. Also, in using a different instructional framework that is designed for a district of high need, like Youngstown. Kibler said he could not speak for the previous twenty-nine (29) years in which a teacher was rated skilled. He did not observe those teachers. He did say based on some of the matrix that we are using now, the district is attempting to hone on a teacher’s true quality of instruction and if it is not where it needs to be, how can the district provide support for them to get there? That is the intent of the quality review.

Dr. Richard wanted a clarification of who was John LaPlante, the district Chief Information Officer.

Filipovich and McGinnis provided an overview and status update of the Ohio Improvement Process. They explained how the district utilizes the state of Ohio’s 5 Step Process for implementation and monitoring. Filipovich and McGinnis reported on the protocol taken in each leadership team meeting on a district (DLT), building (BLT) and teacher (TBT) levels.

Dr. Richard commented that maybe there could be further follow-up at some point, especially because the strength is in the TBTs. That is where it comes together in the classroom. The district and building levels are critical portion of that. McGinnis commented that guidance documents are provided in the artifacts for BLTs, DLTs and TBTs.

Dr. Richard further commented, that in the past which was not by design, the way things came out in practice at the state level, often times the state heard that it is more about forms and the protocols than the conversations that should be taking place. It is refreshing to hear that it sounds like some of those conversations are happening here and you will actually see a shift from the department along those lines.

Nicholas Santucci, asked who is leading these conversations at the district level, DLTs, BLTs, and TBTS? Who are the ones sitting in on these conversations and leading these discussions?

Filipovich responded and referred to the samples of meeting agendas in the artifacts. Typically at the district level McGinnis and Filipovich will facilitate the district level meetings. There is representation of a principal, a teacher represented from every building, and some of the senior leadership members.

Santucci responded if the principals sit in on these meetings? Filipovich and McGinnis responded that principals sit in on the DLT meetings and it is used as a communication structure as well.
Mohip responded that at the BLT level it should be the principal alone, especially the DLT meetings. We want to shift it to where we have teacher leaders running those BLTs and having grade level chairs running TBTs. We are not at that point yet, we are building. There are some schools that are at different levels.

A lot of the stuff we are talking about is initiated at the district level but we know that is not where we want to be. We want to be able to start responding to the needs of schools, when the schools have strong cultures and strong leadership teams that is what we are really moving too.

The best conversations as Dr. Richard mentioned are the ones that you move away from the quorums, you actually start talking about students, instruction, and those conversations are facilitated by teachers. The principals are there merely to be part of the conversation, not lead it. That is where our guidance tools are taking us. It will take time.

Mohip provided the last remarks of the presentation with an overview of Let’s Talk. Let’s Talk is a web based program located on the district’s website. Let’s Talk allows anyone to make comments online or they can call the hotline. The district will document the dialogue in the Let’s Talk system. We have the goal to return all calls within 72 hours. We are at a 99% pace. Customer feedback is also given and we are currently at a high level of 9 out of 10. Let’s Talk is used in daily operations, where schools and our operation team enter service requests as well as the community, parents and stakeholder within the valley enter their concerns, needs, questions or even a compliment.

Mohip closed the presentation and asked the ADC members if there were any follow-up questions.

Dr. Richard recognized that with the changes that have occurred over the past 5 days, he thanked Philecia Carpenter for her assistance in preparing for the ADC meeting. In the future, he commented that to get a better understanding he would like to have conversations with his ADC colleagues. Possibly a portion of future upcoming meetings can be designated as a time to dive deeper into the information presented.

There were no follow-up questions from Santucci or Shivers.

Mohip thanked the members for their time and attention. He encouraged the members to really look at their documents and artifacts. It is a really strong framework of what we are doing. It is a high level overview, but when you dive in we are showing you various specifics. Essentially we are showing you that this is the work that will move this district, especially if we sustain these practices over time and don’t give up on it. Often in education, things shift and change, but this is sound and solid. Mohip explained this is why he wanted to take the ADC members and meeting attendees through curriculum, instruction, assessment. He wanted to talk about how we are holding ourselves accountable; this isn’t just about accountability for the teachers but accountability for the entire system. The district is
spending approximately $120 million dollars per year. We want to make sure that what we are spending our money on works.

When Mohip walked into the Youngstown School District, which over the past decade had spent over a billion dollars on instruction and operating affected the district significantly with lowered student outcomes. In moving forward over the next decade, spending another $1.5 billion dollars. We want to make sure that the investment is going into helping students and raising their outcomes. That is why everything we have talked about has been about growth, we are not focused right now on the actual achievement levels. We are focusing on making sure all of our students grow and reach their respective growth targets because that will sustain year end and year out. Over the next 2 or 3 years, we will see significant raises in the achievement levels of our students as compared to grade levels. This is work, this what we are committed to. And what we have been doing all year. And what we plan to continue to do over the next 5 years and beyond.

Dr. Richard thanked the staff and any staff members for their assistance tonight. He also thanked the public who attended out of interest the meeting.

IX. Adjournment – 7:52 p.m.

Motion by: Nicholas Santucci Seconded by: Vincent Shivers

Roll Call Vote:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. John Richard</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicholas Santucci</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vincent Shivers</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>