YOUNGSTOWN BOARD OF EDUCATION
REGULAR BOARD MEETING
TUESDAY, AUGUST 14, 2018
4:30 P.M.
CHOFFIN CAREER AND TECHNICAL CENTER COMMONS AREA
THE YOUNGSTOWN BOARD OF EDUCATION

I. CALL TO ORDER
II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE
III. MOMENT OF SILENCE
IV. ROLL CALL
V. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   • MAY 9, 2018
   • MAY 22, 2018
   • JUNE 12, 2018
   • JUNE 26, 2018
   • JULY 10, 2018
VII. REQUESTS TO ADDRESS THE BOARD (Citizens Participation)
VIII. BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS/PRESENTATION
IX. TREASURER’S REPORT
X. SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT
XI. BOARD MEMBERS COMMENTS (5 MINUTES)
XII. PRESIDENT’S REPORT
XIII. UNFINISHED BUSINESS
XIV. NEW BUSINESS
XV. EXECUTIVE SESSION (As needed)
XVI. ADJOURNMENT
BOARD OF EDUCATION

The undersigned chair or presiding officer, under oath, certifies that a meeting of the Board of Education was held on ______________________. The Board closed its meeting as permitted by the Open Meetings Act of Ohio. The only matters considered or discussed during the closed portion of executive session of its meeting are as checked below:

1. _______ The appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion, or compensation of an employee or the investigation of charges or complaints against an employee, official, licensee or student, unless the employee, official, licensee or student requests a public hearing;

2. _______ The purchase of property for public purposes or the sale of property at competitive bidding;

3. _______ Conferences with the board’s attorney to discuss matters which are the subject of pending or imminent court action;

4. _______ Preparing for, conducting, or reviewing negotiations or bargaining sessions with employees;

5. _______ Matters required to be kept confidential by federal law or rules or state statutes;

6. _______ Specialized details of security arrangements.

This _____ day of ______________________, ______

__________________________
Chair or Presiding Officer
May 9, 2018

The Youngstown Board of Education met for the regular meeting on May 9, 2018 at East High School, 474 Bennington Street. The meeting was called to order by President Kimble at 5:30 pm with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble

Mr. Shadd had to work and could not attend the meeting.

APPROVE AGENDA

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Kimble to approve the agenda for May 9, 2018.

On discussion Mr. Hunter asked if he could move his five minutes to the beginning of the meeting because he had a work obligation and would have to leave the meeting early. Ms. Kimble said that would be fine to move it right after requests to address the board.

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays
Motion passed

BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS/PRESENTATIONS

None

REQUESTS TO ADDRESS THE BOARD

None

BOARD COMMENTS - #1

Mr. Hunter wanted to address administrators working in the Youngstown City School District that apparently did not have administrative licenses. He said he would be speaking on information that anyone could acquire through public records request or from the Ohio Department of Educations’ online Educator Search. Mr. Hunter said since the District has allegedly been reorganized for improvement you would think that the least that we could expect
is for an administrator to have the basic standards required by the state of Ohio and that would be an administrator's license. He said he would like some answers from this administration regarding the justification for people employed in administrative positions without the proper administrative license. These were the names he asked about:

Amanda McGinnis – Deputy Chief of School Improvement and Programs
Connie Coburn – Deputy Chief of Early Literacy/IFS
Julie Hazly – Dean of Discipline
Terrell Young – Dean of Students
Aderonja Foreback – Dean of Students
Angel Laudmilt – Dean of Students
Brian Morrow – Dean of Students/Choffin Head Football Coach
Jason Ray – Dean of Students
Evelyn Veal – Dean of Students
Rachel Woodburn – Dean of Students
Mikyraa Kinnard – Dean of Students

The detailed list used by Mr. Hunter for employees working at the district with no current, valid administrator license, information retrieved from various CEO personnel updates is attached. (See Exhibit I)

Ms. Kimble said she would also like to add that Tracy Schuler-Vivo did not have an administrator's license and she held a administrators position.

Ms. Adair asked the superintendent what was the reason for hiring people or promoting people without the proper credentials and would like the Superintendent to get answers. Mr. Meranto said he would ask the human resource department, Cheryl McArthur and check with the CEO, Mr. Mohip. However, Mr. Meranto said a Dean of Studentis position did not have to have an administrative license.

Ms. Sanderson said that to have an alternative license you have to have work experience but if these employees do not have an alternative license that means they have no prior work experience in the position that they hold.

TREASURER’S REPORT

The treasurer announced that the new Deputy Chief of Finance, A.J. Gimnetti had begun working and that the new fiscal secretary would start on Wednesday, May 30, 2018. She also told the board she had passed out minutes for the board to read that would be on the agenda for the next meeting.

SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT

The Superintendent reiterated that his area is operations and reported that the food service department would feed breakfast and lunch during summer school at nine locations which should feed approximately 1,600 students daily. The food service is also working on a district wellness policy. The food service was recently audited by the Department of Education and received an
excellent review. A new chiller will be installed at East. The project at 20 West Wood for YEC is moving along as expected and YEC is packing boxes to prepare for the move out of Wood Hall to the 11 Ward building. The business office is excepting quotes for insurance for the next fiscal year. Safety and security purchased 100 bolo sticks for the schools and the district also purchased 20 exit door alarms for the schools. Mr. Morvay wrote a district protocol policy that will be shared with the board after it is approved by the CEO. Fobs were ordered for all buildings to improve staff safety. All custodians are being evaluated this year and each building is having a monthly walk through. The district is clearing out the warehouse and delivering all the materials that are in the warehouse to the buildings.

Ms. Adair asked why Mr. Morvay was writing district policy. Mr. Meranto said he misspoke was not writing policy but modifying/updating the current policy to make it current. Ms. Adair asked what is the current student attendance numbers/percentages and staff attendance rates. She asked how much the district has paid for substitute teachers’ year-to-date and is it true that some substitutes are refusing to go to certain schools. Ms. Adair wanted to know if there were members from other school districts playing on the rugby team. She asked if Mr. Shepas was following the GPA for athletics which is supposed to be 2.5. Ms. Adair asked about the violence at Taft and Chaney and the vulgar language used by some students in the district. She wanted to know does the district have a business curriculum because she is hearing that the district does not. She also asked what happened to the African American History classes. Mr. Meranto said he would provide a list of classes to the board at the next meeting. She said she heard that the guidance counselors are not directing students toward classes that would help them be viable in the workforce upon graduation. She told Mr. Meranto that she would provide him with a list of all the questions she had requested information about so he could bring answers back to the board.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS - #2

Ms. Adair talked about the article that was in the OSBA magazine about special education. She asked that the members would read that article then they could discuss where the district had fallen short with special education at the next meeting.

Mr. Murphy said even though it is the end of the school year he wanted to say again that the drop off and pick up of students at Chaney with buses and cars is still a dangerous situation and if something is not done the district is going to have a serious problem.

Ms. Cvetkovich and Ms. Sanderson had no comments.

PRESIDENT’S REPORT

Ms. Kimble talked about the Youngstown Early College graduation. Ms. Kimble said there were 53 students that graduated: 48 with an associate’s degree and 11 with honors; it was very nice. The Youngstown foundation announced that the college scholarships were doubled from $3,000 to $6,000 and every student who will be attending Eastern Gateway or Youngstown State University received the scholarship. She also stated going forward she hopes this great program is not watered down. Ms. Kimble said she attended an OSBA executive meeting and one of the lobbyists that work for OSBA was there. He told those attending the meeting that he did not
think that HR512 would pass. Ms. Kimble said she would like to bring a resolution of objection and concern regarding putting turf on the Chaney field because it makes no sense.

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to submit a resolution of objection and concern about turf at Chaney High School to see it, review it and discuss. During discussion the board determined that a vote to bring the resolution was not needed and Ms. Adair withdrew the motion.

Ms. Kimble also said that after some research is done on these administrators or people who are working in administrator positions that we bring something pertaining to that too because Mr. Mohip claimed these people working with our students were highly qualified and if this is the case these people are not qualified.

Ms. Kimble mentioned that Mr. Mohip did not attend the YEC graduation services and she felt he should have been in attendance to make some comments.

Ms. Adair said she would like a performance audit done by the State Auditor’s office and she dares CEO Mohip to say no. She said Niles had a performance audit done and found out they were in bad shape; they recently tried to pass a levy and it failed. She said she resents the fact that anyone would report that she is giving out inaccurate information about the amount of money needed to apply turf to Chaney.

Ms. Sanderson said that to clear up the issue of the amount of money needed for turf the CEO could submit the bill to the Vindicator and to the Board to show that they would not be spending $1 million dollars of the tax payer’s money. Ms. Sanderson said that they should put a motion on the floor to get a performance audit done by the State Auditor’s Office. Ms. Sanderson said if he wants to say no he can and they will deal with that later.

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Sanderson that the board contact the state auditor’s office to come to the district and conduct a performance audit as soon as possible. On discussion Mr. Murphy wanted to know if the Board could make the request or if the District has to apply. Ms. Tyson said she felt that the request would have to come from the CEO.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Kimble
Nays:
Motion passed

Mr. Hunter left the meeting at 6:32 pm and was not present for the vote.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

The Board members were discussing the dates for their Board Retreat. The last dates discussed were June 29 to July 1, 2018 but the members said this would not be a good time for everyone. The Treasurer said she would check to make sure what were the last dates discussed by the board.
NEW BUSINESS

None

EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Mr. Murphy to go into executive session for the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion, or compensation of an employee or the investigation of charges or complaints against an employee, official, licensee or student, unless the employee, official, licensee or student requests a public hearing.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Kimble

Nays

Motion passed

The board went into executive session at 6:48 pm and exited at 7:29 pm.

ADJOURN MEETING

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Adair to adjourn the meeting with an all in favor call. All five members still in attendance were in favor.

Meeting ended at 7:33 p.m.

President  

Treasurer
EXHIBIT I
The Youngstown Board of Education met for their regular meeting on May 22, 2018 at Choffin CTC, 200 East Wood St. in the commons area. The meeting was called to order by President Brenda Kimble at 5:35 pm and opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

Roll call was taken with the following board members in attendance:

Kimble, Murphy, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter

Ms. Kimble said let the record show that Mr. Shadd and Ms. Sanderson had to work but Mr Shadd said he was going to try to make the meeting

Mr. Shadd entered the meeting at 5:55 pm and Ms. Sanderson arrived at 6:20 pm.

APPROVE AGENDA

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Cvetkovich to approve the agenda for May 22, 2018.

On discussion Mr. Hunter asked about the two resolutions that Ms. Kimble said she would be bringing to the meeting one in particular addressing the issue of members of the administration that do not have proper licenses. Mr. Hunter wanted to know if that was coming up in new business or was it just not a part of this agenda. Ms. Kimble said it was not a part of this agenda because there was some more information that came after that and they could discuss it in executive session.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Kimble, Murphy, Adair, Cvetkovich
Nays: Hunter
Motion passed

MINUTES

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Cvetkovich to approve the minutes for March 12, 2018, March 13, 2018 and April 24, 2018.

On discussion Ms. Adair said she did not feel that the minutes from the special meeting had enough details about the discussion held during the special meeting. Mr. Hunter suggested that the minutes from March 12, 2018 be pulled so that they could be retyped and keep the others on
the agenda to vote. Ms. Adair said she would not have a problem with that change. Mr. Murphy then withdrew his motion.

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Mr. Hunter that the March 12, 2018 minutes be retooled and returned to the board at a later date.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays:
Motion passed

BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS/PRESENTATIONS APPROVE AGENDA

Rick Shepas and the coaches of the East High School Rugby Team were presented with medals. Mr. Murphy wanted to extend his personal congratulation and said that he and Ms. Kimble had a opportunity to go to the championship game and the students represented the district well. He said it was unbelievable and great to be there. See the attachment for the names of the coaches and members of the team. (Exhibit II)

REQUESTS TO ADDRESS THE BOARD

None

TREASURER’S REPORT

The Treasurer presented the Board with their invoices from Attorney Roberts and discussed the fiscal year versus prior year comparison report. Mr. Shadd questioned the amount of money that had been spent comparing the balance of the fiscal current year and the past fiscal year. Ms. Adair once again asked if there was a staffing plan and commented that too much money is being spent on wages, consultants, renovation of the board building and at what point are we going to run out of operating funds and have to go to the city to ask for more money on the backs of the poor people of this city.

Ms. Adair wanted to know about the following check numbers 181618, 181811, 180978, 181100, 181685, and 181668. Ms. Adair wanted to know what the board members were going to do and she said she will not support another levy.

Ms. Cvetkovich asked what Stark County COG was and what a memo check is. Ms. Tyson explained that Stark was our medical insurance provider and memo checks were created for payroll deductions for the portion that the district pays.

Mr. Hunter asked about Aaris Therapy, Youth Intensive Services and wanted to know what these vendors are doing for our district and where?

Ms. Adair asked about checks written to Mr. Mohip, why did we pay and why is that not being sent to the state. Ms. Tyson reported that the state reimburses for any of his travel expense.
Mr. Shadd said that purchase services have increased as well as wages and stated that under HB70 there is no oversight for spending and he believes that the buck stops with the Governor because this was his plan.

Mr. Murphy said that Mr. Mohip said he was using the five year forecast as his budget. He went on to say that he thinks the state needs to come in and take over the budget because they are the only one who has the power to take over the finances and stop him. Mr. Murphy said that the CFO will run the finances down so low and then the will come in and take over and stop them.

Ms. Adair asked about checks to the Redzone, was there a contract and how much? Ms. Adair asked Mr. Meranto if he knew how many students were enrolled in the after school programs and what is the district using to measure if the afterschool programs are working academically. Mr. Meranto said he would get that information.

SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT

Mr. Meranto answered some questions that Mr. Adair asked in the May 9, 2018 meeting. He stated that the student attendance rate is 91%, a .71 increase from this time last year and a .6 decrease in tardiness this year. Teacher attendance is 93% and he said the Vindicator did a story that listed all the school districts in Mahoning County and Trumbull County and it was not bad. Our district was 5% higher than the attendance rate at Austintown LSD. Mr. Meranto said the process of tracking students is done electronically and daily in Dazzle and Progress Book. High school teachers take attendance each period. The District has attendance clerks and attendance assistants who call the homes if a student is not in school and they have not heard from them. They track when students have a certain number of absences and the District will send out intervention employees to see why the student is not attending school. The principals talk with the teachers regularly about students who are skipping classes.

Mr. Meranto said the GPA for all Youngstown sports is 2.5. Mr. Meranto said you can be on the team if your GPA is lower but you cannot play. Mr. Meranto said Youngstown CSD is paying the Rugby coach and paying for the uniforms. Ms. Adair said she is proud of our team but she is wondering who is paying the insurance and Mr. Meranto said the district was paying the insurance.

Mr. Meranto said that the District is doing what they can do at Chaney to try to make it better and they are not avoiding the discipline issues. Mr. Meranto passed out the course offerings and African American history is on the list but students have to sign up and that is their choice. Ms. Adair said she received a report of fights per grade, per building from a meeting she went to at the NAACP and she said whatever the District is doing is not working. Mr. Meranto said what happens in the streets gets brought to the schools and the District is trying different approaches to address the problems with the students.

BOARD MEMBERS COMMENTS
Mr. Hunter talked about Ms. Roshay Huff who now has a one year alternative license but prior to that she had a 5 year teaching license for P to 3 but her alternative principal's license is for 8 through 12 which is interesting since she is coming out of early education and going to high school education. Mr. Hunter asked how this person is coming out of the gate with no administrative experience receiving $101K as a high school principal. Mr. Hunter said the background does not equate with the salary. Mr. Hunter said he had brought up the idea of an early educators program to Mr. Brenner that could possibly be based at YSU, the idea being high achieving students from our district going into teaching and coming back to the district to teach. They would therefore have the skills and understand the culture of the district they would be teaching in. Mr. Hunter said he talked to CEO Mohip about this idea and he did nothing with it. He said the idea was not to force people into teaching but to help them with opportunities to develop their own special talents and encourage them to see what is possible. Mr. Hunter said that he did try to reach Mr. Tressel twice to talk about his idea but did not hear back from him. Mr. Hunter said some people tend to criticize the Board for not having ideas to move our students forward and allegedly not wanting to work with stakeholders but neither of those assertions are accurate. Mr. Hunter stated we all should be able to work together despite how we feel about HB70 to secure the best path forward for our children.

Mr. Shadd talked about the YIEC graduation and the play "Little Shop of Horrors" put on at Chaney and how entertaining it was. He wanted to thank everyone for the work everyone did to put the production together. Mr. Shadd talked about the afterschool programs and how the Board had asked for a tracking system to be put in place when the programs started years ago. The process was instituted but now it seems that a part of the process has been fragmented. He wanted to applaud the efforts of Mr. Hunter efforts for trying to reach out to Mr. Tressel for creating or inviting people to understand onboarding for education. There was also a move before HB70 working with the HR person to seek out teachers from HBCU's (Historically Black Colleges and Universities) and working with YSU to encourage high achieving students to go into education. He said he is glad that these thoughts have not died with the Board and how the members are thinking about not only now but in the future. Mr. Shadd when we impact our financial stability negatively, we impact our ability to educate.

Ms. Adair talked about the students not returning chrome books or returning them damaged and there being consequences. She said students have to be taught responsibility.

Ms. Cvetkovich read some items from the OSBA bulletin; all members receive the OSBA bulletins. She also brought some pamphlets that talked about why there is music in school for any member who wanted a copy.

Mr. Murphy had no comment.

**PRESIDENT'S REPORT**

Ms. Kimble went to Choffin CTC graduation services. She reported that there were about 164 students in total but what was missing from the list was visual performing arts. Ms. Kimble said that the person in charge of visual performing arts does not have credentials so those students could not graduate with credentials. Ms. Kimble said the CEO moved the program down to Choffin and said that they would receive credentials but they did not receive any, they received diplomas but no credentials.
Ms. Kimble said the League of Women Voters sent a letter asking for the local chapter asking the board to pass a resolution opposing HB512; more than 73 boards of education have already written letters. Ms. Kimble said she will bring a resolution about HB512 to the next meeting along with all the other resolutions that she was supposed to bring to this meeting.

Ms. Kimble said she also attended a program at McGuffey that was very nice.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ms. Kimble announced that some board members, citizens and community leaders from Youngstown were traveling to Columbus on Wednesday along with others from Lorraine CSD, Maple Heights SD, Trotwood Madison SD, Warrensville Heights SD and East Cleveland CSD. The trip may be cancelled because there was no speaker of the house in Columbus and so no sessions can be held.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to go into executive session for a discussion of a contract with the state auditors. Mr. Shadd said that he would like to go into executive session to talk about the contract. Ms. Tyson said she did not see anywhere on the list that an executive session for this discussion would be appropriate; Mr. Hunter agreed. Ms. Adair withdrew the motion.

Ms. Adair said at the last meeting the board voted to have a performance audit as per her request. Ms. Adair said she contacted the office and was told that a contract has to be discussed and negotiated and they need to know how extensive they want the contract to be. Ms. Adair stated that someone would be coming to the June 12, 2018 meeting to make a presentation. Mr. Hunter then called point of order because the time was then 7:30 pm.

ADJOURN MEETING

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Shadd to adjourn the meeting with an all in favor call. All members were in favor.

Meeting ended at 7:31 p.m.
THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF
YOUNGSTOWN CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT
YOUNGSTOWN, OHIO

June 12, 2018

The Youngstown Board of Education met for their regular meeting on June 12, 2018 at Choffin CTC, 200 East Wood St. in the commons area. The meeting was called to order by Vice President Michael Murphy at 4:30 pm and opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

Roll call was taken with the following board members in attendance:

Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter

Mr. Shadd and Ms. Kimble were absent for roll call. Ms. Kimble arrived at 4:32 pm and Mr. Shadd arrived during executive session.

APPROVE AGENDA

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to approve the agenda for June 12, 2018.

On discussion Ms. Adair said she would like to amend to have the attorney for the board come and talk to the members right away so that he could come and go. Mr. Murphy asked if everyone was okay with that and was there any discussion.

It was then motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to amend the agenda so the attorney for the board, Ed Ostrowski could go first.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays:
Motion passed

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to approve the agenda as amended for June 12, 2018.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Kimble
Nays: Hunter
Motion passed
EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Mr. Hunter to go into executive session for conferences with the board’s attorney to discuss matters which are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays:
Motion passed

The board entered into executive session at 4:35 pm and exited at 5:35 pm. The meeting resumed at 5:36 pm.

MINUTES

It was motioned by Ms. Cvetkovich and seconded by Ms. Kimble to approve the minutes for May 1, May 9, and May 22, 2018.

On discussion Mr. Shadd said he did not recall a meeting where he had not made a comment, referring to the May 1, 2018 minutes. Mr. Hunter said he had a problem with the May 9 and May 22, 2018 meeting minutes. He stated from the minutes on May 9 he brought up the issue of administrators not having licenses and Ms. Kimble brought up having a resolution to express concern about that issue. The minutes from the May 22 talked about the resolution but did not identify what the resolution was about.

It was motioned by Mr. Hunter and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to remove the May 9 and May 22, 2018 minutes from the motion.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays:
Motion passed

It was motioned by Ms. Cvetkovich and seconded by Ms. Kimble to approve the minutes for May 1, 2018.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Adair, Cvetkovich, Kimble
Nays:
Abstain: Hunter
Motion passed
REQUESTS TO ADDRESS THE BOARD

None

BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS/PRESENTATIONS APPROVE AGENDA

RESOLUTION NO. 06.12.18-01, SCHOOL SAFETY RESOLUTION

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Kimble to approve resolution 06.12.18-01 School Safety.

On discussion Ms. Adair said she would like to hear the rationale for the resolution. Ms. Kimble stated the resolution came from the state school board to support their effort as they supported our effort with HB70. Ms. Kimble went on to say that hopefully we will never have to experience what some districts have gone through with the shooting violence but this is just something that says we support safe schools.

Ms. Sanderson said she was very much in support of school safety and having policies concerning those issues but she supports local policies and did not think that school boards should dictate to the federal government nor did she want the federal government dictating to the board. Ms. Sanderson said the board already had some policies in record and the board needs to update them. She felt that the resolution needed to be revised if they were going to adopt the policy and finished her discussion by stating that she was not in favor of any language that had to do with the federal government.

Ms. Adair said absolutely in opposition to guns of any sort around our children and in schools and if this resolution is about banning guns, she is in favor of that. Ms. Adair said we have to be concerned with school safety, primarily in predominantly black districts we do not have kids coming in and shooting up the place but you may get your butt beat, a beat down; we need to concern ourselves with that kind of school safety. Especially in light of what happened last week, one of our young students was walking home from school on East High Avenue and was chased by some crazy old man because he felt the child disrespected his flag. He chased the child, caught him and commenced to giving him a beat down. Ms. Adair said if they were going to talk school safety that needed to be talked about; prevention of fights and prevention of adults attacking children and children attacking adults. Ms. Sanderson asked was Ms. Adair asking to amend the resolution and gear it to our district. Ms. Adair said she just saw the resolution and would like it to be postponed until she could read the resolution; otherwise she is not prepared to vote at this time.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Shaid, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays:
Abstain: Sanderson, Adair
Motion passed
RESOLUTION NO 06.12.18-02, HOUSE BILL 512 RESOLUTION

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Kimble to approve resolution 06.12.18-02, House Bill 512.

On discussion Ms. Adair said her understanding of this resolution was to save the rest of the state from the adverse effect of HB 70. Ms. Kimble replied the resolution was in opposition of HB 512. Ms. Adair said she is against HB 512 because Youngstown and Lorraine would still have to labor under the adverse effects of HB 70 and everybody else in the state will get a three year moratorium. Mr. Hunter and Mr. Murphy explained that this was not what this resolution was about. Ms. Adair said she was just not getting the resolution, Mr. Hunter then read the resolution to the board that explained the opposition was against combining several agencies into one state agency and the negative effect of the bill. Ms. Adair said she was in favor of the resolution but where the heck were they when HB 70 was going on.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays:
Motion passed

REQUESTS TO ADDRESS THE BOARD

None

TREASURER’S REPORT

The Treasurer presented the Board with three recommendations:

Item 1: It is recommended that the Board close an account no longer used for direct deposits at Fifth Third Bank. The remaining balance will be deposited into the Districts Huntington Bank Main Account.

Item 2: It is recommended that the Board close all Fifth Third debit cards and credit cards. New cards will be issued through Huntington Bank.

Item 3: It is recommended that the Board close all JPMorgan Chase accounts with a zero balance.

It was motioned by Mr. Shadd and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to approve the Treasurers recommendations Items 1, 2 and 3.

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nays:
Motion passed
Mr. Hunter had questions for the treasurer about contracts and payments to personnel. He asked about pension pick up which he said seems to be happening routinely for all the district administrators. Mr. Hunter explained that pick up meant the district was paying the retirement portion that the employee would normally pay, which is 14% of their pay. Mr. Hunter asked how customary this was. Ms. Tyson explained that at one point when superintendent Stohla was working at the district MCESC had sent a request for the number of employees and their title that had pick-up. The treasurer said after the list was compiled it was sent to the districts but she could not find her list. She also explained that some schools do offer administrators pick up but normally it is just the superintendent and the treasurer. She mentioned that Austintown, the district Mr. Ginnetti, current Deputy Chief of Finance for Youngstown was employed offers pickup to their principals; they have three schools. She also stated that when the CEO had originally talked about doing pick up she had suggested that they do a smaller percentage if they were going to implement this benefit but when the CFO, Mr. Siemons came he put the necessary paperwork together for the district to get the administrators policy added through STRS. Mr. Hunter then stated that an employee would actually make more money than what is stated on their contract when they receive pick up.

Mr. Hunter’s second concern was an issue with the contracts because they have the boards name on the contract and a place for the signature of the board president, the superintendent and the treasurer but the only names on the contract were the CEO and the treasurer. Mr. Hunter asked if the treasurer actually saw each contract and if she was signing. Ms. Tyson replied that she did not see the contracts and this was a signature stamp and the signature of the CEO may be a stamp too.

The third concern for Mr. Hunter was that there may not be enough staff in the treasurers’ office for all the tasks that the office handles and ask the treasurer to comment. Ms. Tyson stated the office normally consists of a treasurer, assistant treasurer, an accountant, two accounts payable personnel, two payroll personnel, a support secretary and a secretary to the treasurer. She explained how employees retired and they were not replaced and how some were hired and left. She also explained that she had been doing her job and the accountant’s job up to January when the CFO left and then she was doing all the jobs and training. Mr. Hunter asked if the new Deputy Chief of Finance was helping and Ms. Tyson stated that he was supposed to be doing when the CFO did. Mr. Hunter asked are you saying you have enough help and the treasurer replied no, there is not enough help.

Ms. Kimble asked if the new Deputy Chief of Finance was given a job description. Ms. Tyson stated she had not been aware that the district was hiring anyone but she thought that the job description would be the same as the treasurer’s job description since they were basically the same job. Ms. Kimble asked where the contract came from and the treasurer replied that it more than likely was drawn up by the CEO’s law firm. When Ms. Kimble asked about the details within the contract Ms. Tyson explained that she had not seen the contract but thought that it would have been negotiated through the CEO the same way her contract was negotiated with the board.

Ms. Adair asked if the five year forecast was out and could she get a copy. Ms. Tyson said she would get Ms. Adair a copy. Ms. Adair asked the treasurer if she were familiar with the forecast and she said she did not put the final forecast together and she did not plan to discuss it with the board. Ms. Adair asked about the ODE review which stated that the district needed to develop a
budget process and to the best of your knowledge has that started? The treasurer said for FY 19 she did not know and that Mr. Ginnetti and Mr. Mohip would be working on that budget. Mr. Tyson stated that before the CFO left he set out a process but she did not know if that process had been started. Ms. Adair said the report referenced the need for a staffing plan, she said it is under the fiscal section and that is why she is asking the treasurer if this had happened. Ms. Tyson said she did not know if this had happened because HR is in charge of staffing.

Ms. Cvetkovich asked if the fiscal secretary had started. Ms. Tyson replied yes and her name is Carla Novicky.

Mr. Hunter then called a point of order to let the board know they were coming to the time limit on the meeting and still had a substantial portion of the meeting to cover. He asked if they wanted to amend the agenda or move something around on the agenda. Mr. Murphy then suggested that they remove the rest of the agenda and pick it up at the next meeting. Ms. Adair stated that there was so much stuff that needed to be discussed and they had not really talked about the report from the ODE. She said there is unfinished business and other issues that members want to discuss. In terms of extending the time Ms. Adair said she was okay with that.

Mr. Hunter suggested that they extend the meeting for an additional 15 minutes and remove board member comments. Mr. Murphy said he could not do it, he had somewhere to be. Ms. Sanderson said her and Mr. Meranto had somewhere to go as well.

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Sanderson to suspended the rest of the agenda and pick it up at the next meeting. Mr. Hunter asked for clarification if they were going to suspend the rest of the meeting immediately because they did still have 10 minutes. Mr. Murphy restated the motion and it was seconded by Ms. Sanderson to say after the superintendents’ report suspend the rest of the meeting and pick it up at the next meeting.

On discussion Ms. Adair repeated that there was so much stuff that they needed to discuss and she was not ready to vote until she found out when the retreat was supposed to happen. Mr. Murphy said they were off the subject of the motion they were discussing. Ms. Kimble said she remembered August 1st.

On roll call the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Cvetkovich, Kimble
Nays: Adair, Hunter
Motion passed

SUPERINTENDENT’S REPORT

Mr. Meranto said he attended all the high school graduations and for the first time in the district all schools did 8th grade graduation or promotion. Each principal put their own program together and all the services were very well attended. The Superintendent said he just wanted to congratulate the principals publicly. He also attended the Choffin adult graduation services he said in his remarks he acknowledged the Youngstown City School Board because we are one of the few schools in the state that still have adult education programs. The operations team was asked to attend a meeting in Cincinnati for all the urban school districts to talk about all areas of
operations. They did a report out and had an opportunity to share with other districts. Mr. Meranto said he was happy to say that some of the things they are doing in the district are actually ahead of the game in food service, transportation and security. The entire maintenance staff had an in-service on proper cleaning techniques and on-time ordering. This is the first time this has happened in the district.

Mr. Hunter wanted to address the abysmal review from the state with the Superintendent, stating the district does not have a comprehensive professional development plan and the district does not have a participatory budget process, these were two several items read by Mr. Hunter. He specifically addressed the part of the review that focused on communication of the strategic plan to stakeholders stating that the Board knows all about the non-communicative practices of the district and perhaps if the district were practicing communicating information to stakeholders then some of the other issues in the review could have been dealt with. However, without this process it appears that the district is shielding itself from public knowledge of not dealing with special education, not dealing with proper staffing, planning, proper behavioral management practices and that is deeply troubling to him. He said that it is also a troubling to him that the CEO is contracting in the Board's name and unfortunately the Board has no say or involvement in that because they are stakeholders shut off from the process. Mr. Hunter stated that HB70 did not give the CEO the right to contract using the Board's name and went on to say that he would like the superintendent to relay to the CEO his displeasure with the unfortunate path this district is on and his displeasure with him signing off on things not with his name on it but with the Board's name.

Mr. Meranto said he would pass all that on to the CEO and went on to say that he guessed in an effort to reach out to the board Mr. Mohip has invited the board president to start attending the weekly cabinet meetings. Ms. Kimble said she invited the board president and the vice president. Mr. Hunter replied that the president and the vice president are not the board. Mr. Murphy then said we are out of time.

**ADJOURN MEETING**

Mr. Murphy called for motion to adjourn and all in favor. The meeting ended.
The Youngstown Board of Education met for their regular meeting on June 26, 2018 at Choffin CTC, 200 East Wood St. in the commons area. The meeting was called to order President Brenda Kimble at 4:30 pm and opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

Roll call was taken with the following board members in attendance:

Murphy, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble

Mr. Shadd and Ms. Sanderson Kimble were absent for this meeting. The president said let the record show that Mr. Shadd is working.

Ms. Adair asked if there was a quorum and the Ms. Kimble said yes. The meeting then resumed from the agenda of June 12, 2018

**BOARD MEMBERS COMMENTS**

Ms. Adair began by saying at the conclusion of the last meeting she made a request to extend the meeting due to the fact that much more business needed to be discussed. Vice president Murphy stated (and he was out of order) that he could not stay due to a previous commitment. Comments then began to come from other board members stating the same that they did not want to extend the meeting. All these acts were not done according to Roberts Rules which resulted in my opinion, chaos and unprofessionalism. Ms. Adair said she believes that a parliamentarian should be hired to help keep the meetings orderly and professional and this is not the first time she has made this request. We all must take turns speaking, if a person has to leave before adjournment, please quietly excuse yourself and leave. She reminded the board members that a quorum is all that is needed to conduct business. Ms. Adair suggested that as part of the retreat have a parliamentarian present them with a brief tutorial on the basics of parliamentary procedures.

Ms. Cvetkovich said she would pass until they discussed new business.

Mr. Murphy said to remember that the board voted on a two hour meeting for a reason.

Mr. Hunter wanted to pick up where they left off at the last meeting where he was noting to the Superintendent the number of failures that this district is apparently experiencing as noted in the most recent review and he wanted to know if the superintendent had any other updates after discussing these concerns with Mr. Mohip and how he planned to address these failures. He said he would not restate the failures again since they were listed in the review and iterated in the attached proposed resolution.

Superintendent Meranto replied that Ms. Clarie Huff, from ODI had said that even though the issues were listed in the report a lot of them had already been resolved. He said there were a
couple of board members at the presentation and he asked them if that is what they understood. Ms. Kimble said yes, that is what she said. Mr. Meranto said Mr. Mohip had not been in the district for the last couple of weeks and he had not spoken with him about the review. Mr. Hunter said there were sixteen issues and was he suggesting that since March to now most of those sixteen issues have been remedied. Mr. Meranto said that was not what he said, that is what the chair of the review said. Mr. Hunter asked the superintendent what was his opinion on this and Mr. Meranto said he felt that some of the issues had been addressed. Mr. Meranto said that special education had been fixed and Mr. Hunter wanted to know how. Mr. Meranto said they would need to talk to the Chief of Special Education and Ms. Adair asked if he could have her come to the meeting. Superintendent Meranto said no, that would have to go through CEO Mohip. The discussion between Mr. Meranto and Ms. Adair was becoming more combative so President Kimble stepped the dialogue and stated that they know Mr. Meranto does not have any authority over anything and the conversation was getting out of hand for no real reason. Ms. Kimble said if Mr. Meranto did not want to see if Ms. Kopp could come to a meeting she would call her but the board president said she was sure that Mr. Mohip would tell Ms. Kopp she could not come.

Ms. Adair asked how was it then that the athletic director came to a meeting and presented. Mr. Meranto stated that Mr. Shepas reported to him, so Ms. Adair asked once again if they can get a copy of the districts organizational chart so that they can see who reports to whom. Mr.  Meranto said he has not seen one but he will ask for one again. Ms. Tyson said the last one she saw was when Mr. Olverson worked for the district. It was six or seven pages and it had not been published. Ms. Adair said that is a public document and Ms. Tyson agreed and said it should be out on the district website.

PRESIDENT’S REPORT

Ms. Kimble announced that Attorney Ostrowski was there to discuss the two very different forecasts and the resolution that was on the agenda. Ms. Kimble stated there was a forecast out on the system on May 22 and then nine (9) days later another one appeared reducing the district debt considerably.

Attorney Ostrowski was going to explain the difference. Ms. Adair asked why he was there to talk about the forecast and not the folks who prepared it. Attorney Ostrowski said he was not there to tell them whether the forecast was accurate or not accurate but there to talk about the three versions of the forecast that the district had prepared.

He said the forecast that he printed in May and the one he printed in June were significantly different for reasons unknown to him. If anyone looks today they will only see the current forecast that is on the ODE website. He said a district can refine a forecast if something changes but the difference was dramatic it jumps off the page. He said the third resolution of objection and concern derives from the differences in those two forecasts.

He stated that one of the problems this board was having is not being able to get information without doing a public records request. The five year forecasts are public records and they may or may not be accurate but they are what they say they are, these are the numbers that were filed. The numbers are so different that I think the board should consider passing this resolution so the public can see and in this resolution it lists the concerns that were noted by ODE in their review.
Ms. Adair stated that in the past the treasurer would prepare the five year forecast but since Mohips’ arrival he has hired outside entities that have not come to present their findings to the board and I am concerned about separation of powers. Ms. Adair said she had no faith in the forecast. Attorney Ostrowski said the board will do what it can by letting the state know and the auditors know about your concerns. The Treasurer stated that PFR prepared the first forecast in October but the final forecast was prepared by CEO Mohip and his team.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ms. Adair said she still had heard nothing from the representative at the auditor’s office regarding someone coming to the meeting to talk about a performance audit. Ms. Adair said her next step will be to contact auditor Yost. She said she wants someone to tell her that the board does not have the authority to ask for a performance audit and she wants to hear a reason.

Ms. Kimble stated that if everyone was in agreement then they should have a motion for Ms. Adair to continue and bring information back to the board.

It was motioned by Ms. Cvetkovich and seconded by Ms. Kimble that Ms. Adair moves forward with this action. Mr. Hunter asked that the motioned be restated for more clarity. It was motioned by Ms. Cvetkovich and seconded by Ms. Adair that Ms. Adair reaches out to Dave Yost’s office and get answers in regards to having a performance audit done for the district.

On roll call the votes were as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nayes:
Motion passed

NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Kimble asked for a motion to pass the resolution objection and concern regarding the five year forecast and the recent ODE review.

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Cvetkovich that the board pass Resolution No. 06.26.18-01, Third Resolution of Objection and Concern. (ATTACHED)

On roll call the votes were as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nayes:
Motion passed

Ms. Kimble asked if there were any other new business. Mr. Hunter replied that he had a proposed resolution.
It was motioned by Mr. Hunter and seconded by Ms. Adair that Resolution of Concern Regarding the Credentials of Administrative Personnel be accepted by the board. (ATTACHED)

On discussion Mr. Hunter read the resolution and then stated that this resolution was in regard to a prior report he had made at an earlier meeting when he discussed administrators working without valid licenses. Mr. Hunter said that he feels it is the board's duty to express its will that the best administrator and other personnel serve our students.

Ms. Adair said this request goes back a few years when Ms. Ellis was a board member and she wanted to make sure that all employees had proper licenses and here it is resurfacing again. She went on to say that she would like to see who these people are who do not have the license certification that they should have and they are working with our students, that might explain a lot things like why our kids are not doing well on these tests and why they are not acting like they should in our buildings. Ms. Adair said she was absolutely in support of this resolution.

Ms. Kimble asked where any of those employees working under an alternative license granted by the ODE? Mr. Hunter said as was discussed in a listing that I made a few weeks ago it was not just an issue of certain administrators who had alternative license but it was an issue of persons deemed administrators that had there was no discernable license that fit their task of working with children in some cases, but they had positions of trust in some level of management and did not have the qualifications. This resolution just says that we have concerns about that it does not mention any person by name or their credentials, it notes there are questionable credentials.

Mr. Murphy asked had there been a motion, Mr. Hunter said yes we just finished discussion. Mr. Murphy asked if the resolution had a number and gave the resolution number 16.26.18-02

On roll call the votes were as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nayes: 
Motion passed

Ms. Cvetkovich said she sat in on a robo call in regards to Local Officials Take Action on the Electronic Classroom of Tomorrow. The call was a discussion on trying to recoup loss of funds from ECOT due to their fraudulent use of taxpayers' dollars. There is a total loss as a district over a six year period of $4,175,313.00.

It was motioned by Ms. Cvetkovich and seconded by Ms. Adair to fully adopt Resolution No. 06.26.18-03, Resolution to Fully Investigate Fraudulent Billing by the Electronic Classroom of Tomorrow.

On discussion Mr. Hunter wanted to know where the figure of $4,175,313 came from. Ms. Cvetkovich said it is a database that breaks down the loss of funds by every district. Mr. Meranto said it was in the Vindicator. Ms. Cvetkovich said there was a link and she would have to give it to him. The treasurer suggested that this may be the total of funds deducted from the foundation station and sent to ECOT, if so it could be checked. Mr. Hunter said for the record he wanted to note that the $4,175,313 million be incorporated in the resolution in the blank section. (ATTACHED)
On roll call the votes were as follows:

Ayes: Murphy, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble
Nayes:
Motion passed

Ms. Kimble told the board she wanted to share something with the board. It was the summary of the major assumptions that appeared with the five year forecast on the ODE website about revenue.

She read: 1. State funding is trending upward as student enrollment slowly increases.
          2. The district will need to renew its emergency levy, FY21 shows 50% reduction and a full year is realized in FY22.

Ms. Kimble said so whoever is on the board at that time will need to renew the levy.

Ms. Adair said she heard that the turf at Chaney was being installed. Mr. Meranto said that has not happened. Ms. Adair asked if the turf project goes forward what would it cost and who would pay for it. Mr. Meranto said he has heard nothing about it from the CEO.

Ms. Adair asked is it true that there were going to be two teams of everything? Mr. Meranto said that was true. Ms. Adair asked about having enough students but Mr. Meranto said there were enough. Ms. Adair wanted to know how much was the athletic budget?

Ms. Adair said that the oral presentation given by Ms. Huff left something to be desired but the written report was telling and the district has taken a serious dive in the last two years. Ms. Adair asked for the student count and asked if the number was holding steady. She also asked about the part of the ODE review where it talked about math scores. She said the report had nothing positive in it and everything was on the decline and she wanted to know what the district was doing to close that achievement gap. Mr. Meranto said that was not his area and told her she needed to get that information answered by Christine Sawicki and Tim Filipovich, but there is a lot of effort being put into trying to help the teachers improve in instruction.

Ms. Adair said the issue of absenteeism has gone way up and what is being done about that? It would seem to her that once people are hired they need to produce and it does not look like these people are producing. Where is the accountability, where are the outcomes? There is so much identified that is wrong and the board is going to be held accountable and will be dissolved, we have nothing to do with anything going on, they will not even let me in the buildings.

Ms. Cvetkovich asked regarding the ODE review about the challenges, what areas have been fixed and which recommendations in the recommendation section have been implemented? She asked Mr. Meranto if he could get that information, he said he would pass that on to Mohip.
ADJOURN MEETING

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Cvetkovich to adjourn the meeting with an all in favor call. All members were in favor.

Meeting ended at 5:48 p.m.

_________________________          ____________________
President                      Treasurer
The Youngstown Board of Education met for their regular meeting on July 10, 2018 at Choffin CTC, 200 East Wood St. in the commons area. The meeting was called to order by President Kimble at 4:30 pm and opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

ROLL CALL

Members present: Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Kimble, Murphy
Members absent: Shadd

APPROVE AGENDA

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Kimble to approve the agenda for July 10, 2018.

Roll call results were as follows:
Ayes: Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Kimble, Murphy
Nays: 
Motion passed.

Mr. Hunter arrived at 4:35 pm.

APPROVE MINUTES

There were no minutes. Ms. Adair was not pleased about this and said had she known she would not have approved the agenda. Ms. Tyson explained to Ms. Adair the pressure she was under at this time, with numerous projects and doing numerous jobs. Ms. Adair asked if Ms. Tyson had talked to someone about her plight and Mr. Hunter spoke up and said that he talked about how he had gone over this in detail at a previous meeting regarding the office being understaffed. Ms. Adair explained the importance of the minutes again. Ms. Tyson said she was doing what she could do but being one person things were getting done as soon as she could get to them. Ms. Adair said her concern is the legal requirements for minutes and she suggested hiring someone to do the minutes but no one wanted to move forward with this suggestion. Ms. Tyson said she thought it might be a good idea to hire someone to do the minutes going forward.

CITIZENS PARTICIPATION

None
BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS/PRESENTATION

None

TREASURERS REPORT

The treasurer stated that she was in the process of closing FY18 and tried to do everything that was asked of her in the FY17 audit. Ms. Tyson said she would give an update of FY 18 after she is closed.

Ms. Adair asked if the two five year forecast had been straightened out? Ms. Tyson said no one had talked to her about the forecast.

SUPERINTENDENTS REPORT

Mr. Meranto talked about the incoming freshmen who went to Thiel College, the board had asked was that beneficial. Mr. Meranto had said he received a report that 93% of the 9th graders at East earned all required core credits during their freshmen year compared to 61% of freshmen last year. At Chaney this year it was 94% compared to 87% last year. The ninth grade principal at East, Roshay Huff and the ninth grade principal at Chaney, Eboni Williams contribute that to intervention supports and time, relationships and time put into programs for the freshmen. So based on those figures the superintendent said he would have to say that the program was successful.

He reported that they had begun to move all of the furniture from YBC on campus to YEC at the Ward building. Boxes have of teacher materials have been delivered and classes have been assigned so they were definitely on target to begin school there on time.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was motioned by Mr. Hunter and seconded by Ms. Sanderson that the board enters into executive session to conference with the board’s attorney to discuss matters which are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Roll call results were as follows:

Ayes: Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Kimble, Murphy
Nays:

Motion passed.

Time in: 5:05 pm
Time out: 5:50 pm

The meeting was called back to order at 5:55 pm.
BOARD MEMBERS COMMENTS

Ms. Adair shared her response to the editorial written by Bertram de Souza where he slammed primarily in title Board President Kimble and then went on to talk about the rest of the incompetent board. Ms. Adair read the following response she wrote:

The Vindicator troll, lovely known as Bertram de Souza has once again revealed his unbelievable bias against any attempt to challenge the overreaching hand of the government! Sell out! His personal attack of board president Kimble and the rest of us "incompetent" board members is an insult! Five of the seven board members hold Bachelor degrees from universities. Two of us hold masters degrees. I hold a Masters in Business Administration (MBA) which has proven to be extremely beneficial in understanding all district operations.

One of us has a law degree! Based on these facts alone, I challenge deSouza's credentials and for that matter CEO Mohip's who does not hold an Ohio superintendent's license! What are qualifies him to be in control of our children? Why is he attending professional development seminars in Florida and other places around the country? Could it be that he has learned after applying for and being excluded from superintendent positions in three (3) large school districts in other parts of the country that he is "not qualified" for any of those positions. AND, why did he leave Chicago schools? I received notice a few months ago from Chicago schools that they were looking to hire more than 1000 administrators and teachers! So Mohip why did you leave?

Since Mohip's arrival, deSouza and other members of the Vindicators editorial staff have never talked to school board members but has interviewed CEO Mohip several times most recently about the cheating scandal that surfaced after former ADC chairman B Benyo contacted Columbus.

CEO Mohip! He has interviewed with them several times! Why???
That paper has refused to accurately report on the information the Board attempts to bring to the public, even after sending reporters to the meetings.

The board has discussed extremely serious violent acts between students and students attacking adult staff. No mention in the paper! The board has questioned the outlandish over spending by the CEO- particularly the $100 thousand average salaries paid to administrators. Again, no mention in the paper. We have challenged the million dollars paid to two (2) law firms hired by the CEO. $300 thousand plus paid to the firm where his "female friend" works. Neither of those firms are working on the lawsuits filed by the board vs the state. The Board's law firm has never been paid more than $200 thousand in nine (9) months including its billable hours for the state case.

Property tax payers of Youngstown, are you ready for another levy? Believe me at the rate he is spending, its coming!

The paper also refuses to acknowledge the fact that since 2010, the state (represented by three academic distress Commissions (ADC) with three (3) different chairs) has been in control of the academics in our schools. So whose incompetence is it? Who continues to fail our children's academic future? How dare he / they place the blame for this ongoing academic mess on the elected members of the Board! Excuse me Bertram but what does "total control mean"? Look it up! Your paper includes this phrase in almost all of your articles about CEO Mohip. Stop spreading your biases and on a very important level, your racism! You, of all people!

This paper has failed to live up to its constitutional founding fathers mandate - newspapers have been exempted from paying taxes because they did not want the paper to fall under the one sided control of the government! They understood that the populace needed to be accurately informed about the workings of the government! The Vindicator has failed to live up to its constitutional obligation!

The Vindicator has failed 'we the people'!

Jackie
Truth to power!

No other members had comments.
PRESIDENT'S REPORT

Ms. Kimble asked for a motion to continue their appeal. Mr. Hunter said he had been working on a resolution to that affect and asked to share it with the board; he read:

WHEREAS, the Youngstown Board of Education is gravely concerned about the legality of HB 70 and its impact upon the future of education in Youngstown.

WHEREAS, the legality of HB 70 and its impact upon education are matters of statewide interest.

BE IT RESOLVED that the Youngstown Board of Education will pursue an appeal to the Ohio Supreme Court regarding its case against HB 70.

It was motioned by Mr. Hunter and seconded by Ms. Sanderson that the foregoing resolution be adopted.

Roll call results were as follows:

Ayes: Sanderson, Adair, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy
Nays:
Motion passed.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ms. Adair said she sent a letter to auditor Yost about the performance audit and is waiting to hear back from them. She is recommending that the board look for other ways to get their information and not use the Vindicator. Ms. Adair asked where was the retreat going to take place and when. Ms. Kimble said that they had said July 30, July 31, and August 1 from 4 pm. to 7 pm. each day. Ms. Sanderson said they should delegate someone to organize the retreat and suggested that Ms. Cvetkovich take on the task.

There was a lot of discussion about who would facilitate the retreat and the majority wanted OSBA. Ms. Cvetkovich said she would have a report at the next meeting and she would contact OSBA. Ms. Adair requested one of the sessions to be on parliamentary procedures.

NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Hunter said he would like to have a special meeting or carve out a space at a future board meeting for brainstorming about the other day to day legal issues of the district and how we are going to address them as a body. He asked if anyone had suggestions for when this might take place. Ms. Sanderson said she was thinking they could do that as a special meeting since we need to report back to our attorneys and let them know what we are discussing. Also, Ms. Cvetkovich could report back to the board about her event planning. After some discussion the board determined that the next meeting would be focused on the brainstorming session and the retreat.
Ms. Adair said in light of the principals leaving at Taft and Chaney the board should write a letter to say something to the CEO about who will replace those two people and possibly making a recommendation.

**ADJOURN MEETING**

It was motioned by Ms. Kimble and seconded by Mr. Murphy to adjourn the meeting.

Roll call results were as follows:

Ayes: Sanderson, Cvetkovich, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy
Nays: Adair
Motion passed.

Meeting ended at 6:30 p.m.

President

Treasurer