THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF
YOUNGSTOWN CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT
YOUNGSTOWN, OHIO

20 West Wood Street

June 13, 2017

The Youngstown Board of Education met in regular session at the I.L. Ward Building on June 13, 2017. The meeting was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by President Brenda Kimble. The meeting opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

Roll call was taken with the following board members in attendance:

Members present: Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams, Adair
Members absent: Hunter

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Shadd to approve the agenda for June 13, 2017. On discussion Ms. Sanderson had a question regarding the resolutions; Ms. Kimble stated they would be addressed later in the meeting.

Roll call vote results were as follows:

Ayes: Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams, Adair
Nayes:
Absent: Hunter

Motion passed.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Williams to approve the following minutes:

Regular Meeting
May 23, 2017

On roll call vote the results were as follows:

Ayes: Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams, Adair
Nays:
Absent: Hunter

Motion passed.

CITIZEN’S PARTICIPATION

Mr. Louis Muhammad representative of the community high commission and religious affairs committee chairman of the NAACP stated that he was at the meeting representing the children of the district. He said he felt the board was showing a kind of favor for the failure of the CEO and
he said if the CEO fails then our children are going to fail. If the CEO fails to bring academics up that means our children are going to fail. He said he would like to see the children succeed and would like to see the board carve out a role that would complement the CEO because he did not know if there is success if the school would be turned back over to the board but if it did that would be a wonderful thing. He said the board could set a precedent and be the model for every other school board in Ohio as a template to follow to help the children succeed. He said he was not dumping on anybody but he just wanted to bring that spirit that we could raise that spirit of success and achievement for our children.

The treasurer did not have a report but Ms. Adair wanted to ask some questions of the treasurer about information distributed to the board from the last meeting. 1) She wanted to know who Cheryl McArthur was, what her job at the district was and who signed her contract. This question was answered by the treasurer and CAO Olverson. 2) She asked who was Jennifer Merritt and what was she contracted to do? Mr. Olverson and Mr. Mohip addressed this question. Ms. Adair wanted copies of the contracts for these two employees.

**BOARD MEMBERS COMMENTS**

Mr. Shadd talked about the 2017 graduation services for YEC students. He reported that YSU had 51 students who earned an associates degree during the ceremony and 39 of those students were from YEC. He said last year they had 30 students and this year 39 students and the program seems to increase upon its excellence every year and he hopes that it gets national recognition again for their successes as has happened before by Newsweek, US News and the state. Chaney and East students received numerous scholarships. Chaney received over $700,000 in scholarships and the number of graduates increased this year. He also mentioned the graduation of our GED students and over 200 county wide students who graduated from Choffin. Mr. Shadd said he had submitted two different requests one on May 25 and another on June 7, 2017 for some answers to questions to the CEO and has not received answers

Ms. Sanderson gave the report from the last finance committee meeting. She said they discussed some issues with public records requests, the results from the five year forecast and the overspending in the district that would cause the school to need a new tax levy and she said the committee would recommend to the board not to authorize another levy. They would look at the different departments to see where cuts could be made along with the duplication of services and make the recommendations to the commission and the public. They discussed the meeting that Mr. Hunter had with the CEO and the CFO to ask what the total cost would be to the district to reopen the teachers’ contract and give a 5% increase. An answer was given but they did not feel they addressed the total cost to the district. Ms. Sanderson said they were still waiting for that answer and she was not sure if they needed to formally request the information.

Mr. Murphy, Mr. Williams and Ms. Kimble had no comments.

Ms. Adair addressed the board – her document for the record:
Regular School Board Meeting  
June 13, 2017  
Notes/Questions

1. Attached to previous board documents: CEO’s authority over School District –
   a. Conduct employee evaluations – I am requesting copies of all senior staff evaluations, especially all who work at 20 W. Wood St. and all Building level administrators (principals, asst. and TSA’s). Let this request serve as an official request from an elected member of this Youngstown City School District Board of Education. If not responded to within a reasonable amount of time, two (2) weeks, I will make a formal freedom of information act request which attaches to it the State Atty. General’s lawful requirement to provide requested documents in a reasonable amount of time unless lawfully prohibited.
   b. Create a budget for district – I am requesting a copy of such a document for school year 2016 -2017 and for upcoming school year 2017 – 2018.
   c. Modify policies and procedures established by district board – to the CEO and designated staff, please provide copies of any and all board policies and procedures which have been modified. To the Board, in my opinion, the HB70 amendment does not prevent this duly elected Board from reviewing old policies, removing and/or updating policies that are no longer relevant and based on new law and newly discovered areas of concern in district schools, adding to and voting on new policies and procedures.

2. Questions on Tax Abatement request by- Youngstown Campus Associates LLC (75% for 10 years) - Has a letter been sent to the Mayor expressing our negative vote on the last/previous abatement request? May I have a copy of it for my records?
   a. Pg. 5 – reason for abatement request – “10 year period provides expense reduction to aid in marketing the projects…”
   b. Last page: total current minorities – did not list, zero (0), when operational permanent employees – total minorities, did not list zero (0). For these two reasons alone I am asking my fellow board members to once again to vote “NO” on this request. Marketing of a product is part of the cost of doing business. And their apparent lack of a commitment to hire
minorities is not only telling but totally unacceptable. This company wants the council and board, primarily made up of minorities, to approve this but can’t or won’t promise on their paperwork to hire minorities as a portion of their employees. **Board Members just say no! Using us poor tax payers as a means of helping to defray the cost of their multi-million dollar projects is wrong! Vote No!**

3. Looking at CEO Public Update Meeting notes from the Monday May 8, 2017 – there are several written notations stating “Be it resolved, by the **Board of Education of the Youngstown City School District**, Mahoning County, Ohio that on the recommendation of the Chief Executive Officer, the supplemental contract(s) of the following persons shall not be renewed.” The names of certified staff supplemental contracts, certified utility administrators and utility substitutes classified staff, non-certificated staff are identified on a non-renewal list.

4. **Questions: When and who did CEO Mohip make these recommendations to?** Which of you gave consent to the CEO to non-renew these employees. Based on what were some if not all of these people non-renewed? Evaluations, RIF due to reduced enrollment numbers? Has a staffing plan finally been produced? For the millionth time, give me a copy! Why have these employees been non-renewed and why is the CEO giving this false message that the Board had anything to do with this?

5. **Choffin – MCCTC consolidation** – I asked at about this at the last meeting and no one indicated they had any knowledge about this. Since the meeting, I have learned through the media and other sources that this change will happen once voted on and approved by the MCCTC Board.

Our two (2) administrators, Meranto and D’Amico will be replaced by three (2) people from MCCTC – One director and two (2) principals. At what cost? Who is paying their salaries? Us or them? Will the students they anticipate Choffin gaining as a result of this change count on our district’s ADM or theirs? Who can and should answer my questions? This is another example of the Board being left out, not being informed and unfortunately finding out about district business from the media or other sources! **Sounds like what is happening with President Trump and the leaks that we keep hearing about! WOW!**
6. Treasurers report – Total of $6,853.09, includes $150 in mileage, pd in April 2017 to C McArthur
Total $7,107.20, includes $150 in mileage, pd in April 2017 to Jennifer Merritt. Who are these people? What were they contracted to do? Who approved their contracts?

7. Did Joe Meranto get a raise? Is his salary now $125,000? Based on what was this increase approved? Need to see his evaluation?
UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ms. Kimble said she wanted to go over what the duties of each committee should be since people wanted to get started with their meetings. Ms. Kimble spoke about committee structure to clarify what each committee is supposed to do: the finance committee—checks and balances, House Bill 70 anything dealing with contracts and the district as written in the handouts that the board president passed out a few weeks ago and the CEO committee is to create meetings of concerns of the full board about the district and report the information back to the board. Ms. Kimble requested that each committee stay on track so that you do not overflow into other committees and make them less effective. She wanted to know if they wanted to decide on the number of meetings a committee could have. Ms. Adair said she would rather leave that to the discretion of the committee chair. Mr. Shadd questioned if the HB committee could look at the 55 page plan that from the CEO that shows a rubric and he wanted to make sure they had information of how the plan is being enacted and the outcome of those pieces. Ms. Kimble said that would be a part of the HB committee.

Ms. Adair said she wanted to know why board members were not receiving ROBO calls. Mr. Mohip said the messages usually go to parents. Mr. Williams said they used to always get them and Mr. Mohip asked Ms. Kimble to send an email with all the board members phone numbers so they could get these calls.

Ms. Adair said they use to get emails about occurrences that happen at the schools, this no longer happens. She went on to speak about the use of profane language by students and she asked the board to work on a new policy or amend the policy regarding profane language. She also asked about dress code and absenteeism.

NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Kimble brought up the tax abatement and Mr. Williams said he had not received a copy of the current request. Ms. Adair asked about the time line and Ms. Kimble said it had to be addressed by June 19, 2017. Mr. Williams asked was it 100% or 75% and the board members let him know it was for 75%. Mr. Williams stated that we know if the abatement is 75% it is automatically given and we would just be stating our objection.

Ms. Adair still wanted to discuss the issue and started by saying she is objecting to the tax abatement. She understands that council can approve the 75% without their approval but she said she believes they need to hear from the board, this has got to stop. The request was for a 10 year period to aid in marketing the project and on the last page of the document it talks about what they will do regarding hiring: total minorities zero and when the project is complete and running total minorities hired will be zero. These two reasons alone Ms. Adair said she is asking the fellow board members to vote no on this request. Marketing the product should be on them and not hiring any minorities is not on telling but totally unacceptable. Ms. Adair said they want minorities to approve the project but do not want to hire any minorities. Ms. Adair said vote no.

Mr. Shadd said when we are in good shape financially we want to do things to help the community grow. Mr. Shadd believes the district will grow and that Mr. Mohip will do some things to help the district grow, but he is not in support of any tax abatement until the district
financial house is in order in light of the recent five year forecast projections. He would like to make sure that the children get the best bang for our bucks.

Ms. Adair said according to the five year forecast estimated enrollment is projecting a 600 student decrease and the amount of money will be reduced and she agrees that they need to hold the line.

It was motioned by Ms. Adair and seconded by Ms. Kimble that the board submit a letter to the mayor in reference to this tax abatement to reject the request by the for Youngstown Campus Association, LLC.

Ayes: Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams, Adair
Nays:
Absent: Hunter

Motion passed.

Mr. Shadd made a request that the board vote to send Ms. Kimble’s name in as outstanding board member through the OSBA for her work on House Bill 70. Mr. Shadd read an excerpt of what he wrote as an example for the nomination. It was motioned by Mr. Shadd and seconded by Mr. Murphy to submit the name of Brenda Kimble as a nominee for outstanding school board member for 2017.

On discussion Mr. Williams said he supported the nomination because he has attended meetings and Ms. Kimble is sought after for her conversations regarding HB70.

Ayes: Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams, Adair
Nays:
Absent: Hunter

Motion passed.

**EXECUTIVE SESSION**

It was motioned by Ms. Sanderson and seconded by Ms. Adair to adjourn to executive session for issues covering state and federal law, negotiations of contracts and an employee complaint against an official.

Roll call vote results were as follows:

Ayes: Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams, Adair
Nays:
Absent: Hunter

Ms. Kimble stated there may be formal action taken when the regular meeting resumed.

The board entered executive session at 5:18 pm.
Mr. Williams left the meeting at 6:39 pm.
The board exited executive session at 6:46 pm.

The meeting was called back to order at 6:48 pm.

Motion by Mr. Shadd motioned and Mr. Murphy seconded to end the meeting and forego voting on the four resolutions. On discussion Ms. Adair asked if they would amend the wording of the motion to say that the board would recess and reconvene to complete our business at a designated date and time. Mr. Shadd restated the motion to say that the meeting would reconvene at a later date, it was seconded by Mr. Murphy.

Discussion – Ms. Adair explained that there were issues discussed in executive session that will need to be addressed by further discussion and a vote and we have run out of time.

It was then motioned by Mr. Shadd and seconded by Mr. Murphy to recess the meeting and reconvene on June 19, 2017 at 4:30 pm.

Roll call vote results were as follows:

Ayes: Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd, Williams, Adair
Nays:
Absent: Hunter

Motion passed.

Motion by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Shadd to adjourn the meeting.

All in favor was unanimous for the 5 members still in attendance at the meeting.

It was motioned by Mr. Shadd and seconded by Mr. Murphy to adjourn, all five members still in attendance at the meeting were in favor.

The meeting adjourned at 6:55 pm.

________________________  ________________________
President                      Treasurer