Mid-year District Review Report
Youngstown City School District IRN: 045161
Review Conducted Nov. 19-21, 2014

Organization of this Report

Youngstown District Review Overview .......................................................... 2
Youngstown District Review Recommendations Status and Academic Recovery Plan Status .......... 6
Appendix A: Review Team, Activities, Schedule, Site Visit ........................................ 29
Appendix B: Enrollment, Expenditures, Performance ............................................. 32
Appendix C: List of Documents Reviewed .......................................................... 44
Youngstown City School District Review Overview

Purpose
Conducted under Ohio law\(^1\), district reviews and mid-year reviews support local school districts in establishing or strengthening a cycle of continuous improvement. Reviews consider carefully the effectiveness of system-wide functions using the Ohio Department of Education’s six district standards: leadership, governance and communication; curriculum and instruction; assessment and use of data; human resources and professional development; student support; and fiscal management. Reviews identify systems and practices that may be impeding improvement as well as those most likely to be contributing to positive results.

Methodology
Mid-year reviews collect evidence for each of the six district standards above. A district review team consisting of independent consultants with expertise in each of the standards review documentation, data and reports before conducting a district visit that includes visits to individual schools. The team conducts interviews and focus group sessions with such stakeholders as board of education members, teachers’ association representatives, administrators, teachers, parents and students. Team members also observe classroom instructional practice. Subsequent to the mid-year on-site review, the team meets to develop findings before submitting a draft report to the Ohio Department of Education. District review reports focus primarily on the system’s most significant strengths and challenges, with an emphasis on identifying areas for improvement. For the mid-year district review, which informs this report, there is a different outcome. This report is designed to provide the status of the department’s District Review Recommendations given in May 2014 and the Academic Recovery Plan created by the district’s Academic Distress Commission in 2014.

Mid-year Review Site Visit
The mid-year review site visit to Youngstown City School District was conducted from November 19, 2014 through November 21, 2014. The site visit included 26 hours of interviews and focus groups with approximately 64 stakeholders. The review team conducted five focus groups with elementary, middle and high school teachers, principals, students and parents.

A list of review team members, information about review activities and the mid-year site visit schedule are in Appendix A. Appendix B provides information about enrollment. Appendix C lists the documents that were reviewed prior to and during the site visit.

District Profile
Youngstown City School District is located in Mahoning County, Ohio. According to the United States Census Bureau, the estimated population as of July 1, 2013, was 65,184, representing a 2.7 percent decrease since the 2010 Census\(^2\). At least 80 percent of the city’s population graduated from high school. The median household income is $24,421, with 35.6 percent of the population living below the poverty line. In comparison, the median Youngstown City School District teacher salary has increased from $52,616 in Fiscal Year 2011 to $55,113 in FY14 (see Table 1 in Appendix B). According to the Bureau of Labor and Statistics, the April 2014 unemployment rate (seasonally-adjusted) for Youngstown-Warren-Boardman, OH-PA Metropolitan Statistical Area was 6.7 percent compared to 5.7 percent for Ohio.

The district’s enrollment continues to decline. The district has experienced a 25 percent decrease in enrollment between 2008-2009 and 2013-2014 (see Figure 1 in Appendix B). There also have been shifts in enrollment demographics. The percentage of black students decreased from 69 percent to 65 percent.

\(^1\)Ohio Revised Code 3302.10
\(^2\)2008 – 2012 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates
and the percentage of white students decreased from 18.2 percent to 15.2 percent over the same time period (see Figure 2 in Appendix B). However, the percentage students that are Hispanic, economically disadvantaged or limited English proficient have all increased as seen in Figure 3 (see Appendix B). The 2013-2014 enrollment numbers by school, race and special population are included in Table 2, Appendix B.

Youngstown is comprised of the following 15 schools, six of which include specialty programs that have admission requirements. Schools with specialty programs are noted with an asterisk. Enrollment by school is shown in Table 2 (see Appendix B).

1. *Chaney Campus, Grades 6-12; offers Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM), Visual Performing Arts, and College and Career programs;
2. *Choffin Careers and Technical Center/Adult Education, Grades 11-12, preK;
3. *Discovery Program at Kirkmere, Grades 3-8;
4. *Discovery Program at Volney, Grades 3-8;
5. *Discovery Program at East, Grades 7 and 8;
6. East High School, Grades 9-12;
7. Harding Elementary, Grades preK-6;
8. Martin Luther King Elementary School, Grades preK-6;
9. Paul C. Bunn Elementary School, Grades preK-6;
10. Programs of Promise at Wilson School, Grades 2-12;
11. *Rayen Early College Middle School, Grades 6-8;
12. Taft Elementary, Grades K-6;
13. William Holmes McGuffey Elementary School, Grades preK-6;
14. Williamson Elementary School, Grades preK-6; and
15. *Youngstown Early College High School, Grades 9-12.

**Student Performance**

Information about student performance includes: (1) the differentiated accountability status of the district, including the ranking; (2) the progress the district and its schools are making toward narrowing proficiency gaps as measured by the gap closure component; (3) English language arts performance and student growth; (4) mathematics performance and student growth; (5) Performance Index performance; (6) annual dropout rates and four- and five-year cohort graduation rates; and (7) suspension/expulsion rates. Data is reported for both the district and all schools and student subgroups that have at least three years of sufficient data.

Three-year trend data (or more) are provided when possible, in addition to areas in the district and/or its schools demonstrating potentially meaningful gains or declines over these periods. The data reported in Appendix B is the most recent available.

1. **The district is High Support Status as of fall 2014.**
   B. Youngstown City School District received a grade of D for the Performance Index and progress of gifted students and students with disabilities. However, the district received a grade of F on the indicators met, annual measurable objectives, four-year and five-year graduation rates and progress of all students (overall) and students in the lowest 20 percent in achievement.

---

3Differentiated accountability defines the roles and expectations of the school district and ODE based upon the performance of the local school district.
4High Support Status represents the districts performing in the lowest 5 percent in the state.
2. The district is not narrowing proficiency gaps.
   A. Youngstown did not meet the 2014 Annual Measurable Objectives for reading (84.9 percent), math (80.5 percent) or graduation (78.2 percent), which resulted in a grade of F (see Figure 4 in Appendix B).
   B. Most subgroups show an upward trend in passing rates for both reading and math. The 2013-2014 reading passing rates for economically disadvantaged, African American, Hispanic, Limited English Proficient, and IEP subgroups are the highest in four years (see Figure 5 in Appendix B). In general, most subgroups continue to show higher passing rates in reading than math (see Figure 6 in Appendix B).

3. The district’s English language arts performance and student growth5.
   A. Youngstown City School District did not meet any state indicators for reading in 2013-2014. The district’s reading passing rates at grades 4, 5, and 6 were greater than similar districts, but all grades still remain lower than the state (see Figure 7 in Appendix B). Most grades show an upward trend in reading passing rates. Grades 6 and 7 increased by approximately 17 and 10 percentage points respectively from 2012-2013 to 2013-2014, resulting in the highest passing rates for those grades in four years (see Figure 8 in Appendix B).
   B. The district was able to make at least one year of growth in reading in 2014 for grades 4, 5, 6 and 8, but it continues to struggle in grade 7. However, the grade 4 reading three-year average remains green7 (see Figure 9 in Appendix B).

   A. The district did not meet any state indicators in math in 2013-2014. Only the math passing rate in grade 5 exceeded that of similar districts (see Figure 10). In addition, passing rates for all grade levels in math were lower than the state. However, math passing rates for grades 5, 6, 7, 8 and 10 show an upward trend (see Figure 11 in Appendix B).
   B. All grade levels on the fall 2014 math Value-Added report show a decrease in progress in 2014 from the previous year. However, only grade 6 continues to show below expected growth for three consecutive years. All but grade 6 made one year’s growth for the three-year average (see Figure 12 in Appendix B).

5. The district’s Performance Index7 scores.
   A. Youngstown’s Performance Index score for 2013-2014 was 77.7. As seen in Figure 13, Appendix B, the Performance Index trend has risen steadily over the past four years.
   B. The sum of points received for accelerated and proficient test scores continues to increase, while the sum of points for basic and limited test scores declines.

---

5Student growth, or growth standard, represents the minimum amount of progress you should expect students in a district to make in a grade.
6Green indicates that students make more than a year’s progress in a single year.
7The Performance Index score measures the achievement of every student regardless of their levels of proficiency. Schools receive points for every level of achievement, with more points being awarded for higher passing scores. Untested students also are included in the calculation and schools and districts receive zero points for them. For the purposes of assigning the letter grades, a Performance Index score of 120 is considered to be a “perfect” score. Districts and schools will receive one of five letter grades from A through F based on the percentage of total possible points earned.
6. Graduation Rates\textsuperscript{8} and dropout rates\textsuperscript{9}.
   A. Youngstown received a grade of F on the fall 2014 Ohio School Report Card for the four-year and five-year graduation cohort rates. Graduation rates also fell below similar districts and the state (see Figure 14). However, there is an upward trend for both four- and five-year rates (see Figure 15 in Appendix B).
   B. The number of dropouts for 2013-2014 increased to 130, which reflects 23 percent more students than 2012-2013 (adjusted to 106 total dropouts) (see Figure 16 in Appendix B).

7. The district’s rates of in-school suspensions, out-of-school suspensions and expulsions by district and school.
   A. With the exception of expulsions per 100 students, the district’s disciplinary actions continue to exceed those of the state (see Figures 17A-D in Appendix B). Youngstown City School District’s “All Discipline Types” and “Other Discipline Types” categories continue to trend upward, resulting in higher 2013-2014 rates than comparison school districts.
   B. Disobedient/disruptive behavior and fighting/violence continue to be the top two reasons for out-of-school suspensions, as can be seen in the number of occurrences per year (see Table 3 in Appendix B). There has been a tradeoff between out-of-school and in-school suspensions for disobedient/disruptive behavior and fighting/violence. While the out-of-school suspensions have decreased, the number of students receiving in-school suspensions has increased by approximately 84 percent in the past three years.

\textsuperscript{8}Graduation rate is the percentage of students that received a regular or honors diploma during or before the end of the school year.
\textsuperscript{9}As defined by the U.S. Department of Education, dropout rate represents the percentage of 16-24-year-olds who are not enrolled in school and have not earned a high school credential (either a diploma or an equivalency credential such as a General Educational Development [GED] certificate).
LEADERSHIP, GOVERNANCE AND COMMUNICATION
Ohio Department of Education District Report Recommendations

I. Provide training for board of education members and central office administration to focus on roles and responsibilities. Include other topics, such as team building, consensus-building techniques and parliamentary procedure. Use pre- and post-surveys to gauge the effectiveness of the trainings for all participants. (p. 20)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

   B. Mark Freeman, an education consultant recommended to the district by the Academic Distress Commission Chair, will conduct the training.

   C. The consultant indicated that he held one-on-one meetings with key administrators and all board members, with the exception of one. The purpose of the one-on-one interviews was to provide each individual with the opportunity to speak freely and confidentially about issues affecting the school district. There were no time or topic constraints during the interviews.

   D. During separate conversations with the superintendent and board president, both indicated that their individual interviews are finished.

II. Develop and implement a communication protocol to improve communication at all levels across the district with the board of education and the community. Survey the community to assess their perceptions of the district. (p. 20)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

   B. In October 2014, the superintendent began providing weekly “Friday Notes” to board members and academic distress commission members. Notes mirror areas of leadership and governance, student support, curriculum, instruction and assessment, data and technology, professional development, and fiscal management. Weekly events are included.

   C. Currently, four separate surveys are being developed: a community satisfaction survey; a parent satisfaction survey; a survey aimed at determining reasons why students have gone to surrounding districts through school choice and/or open enrollment; and a survey designed for community partners.

   D. Board members and the superintendent participated in a “Community Informational Meeting” hosted by the 7th Ward Citizens Coalition at the Faith Community Covenant Church on Oct. 16, 2014. A question and answer session was included.

   E. All job postings and descriptions are available on the district website and the district Facebook page.

   F. The superintendent has scheduled a “State of the Youngstown School District” address for Jan. 22, 2015.

   G. Pamphlets, handbooks and flyers aimed at parents, students and the community are available. Also the school website serves as an information resource.

   H. A marketing plan is being developed through the office of communications director. According to the plan, “More than anything, a marketing plan is a systematic way of changing the self-images of the leadership, administrators and staff to view themselves as agents who carry messages about the school district. In doing so, they transmit these messages in their actions at the school buildings with students and adults, and their actions throughout the community.”
III. Review and revise the One Plan to reflect realistic, reasonable goals and timelines. Establish quarterly benchmarks and develop a protocol to monitor progress. (p. 20)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. The deputy superintendent said that unrealistic expectations have been modified based on this recommendation.
   C. A timeline shows that the district leadership team has taken actions to update the One Plan.
   D. Building leadership teams have created and submitted first drafts of building plans.

IV. Use the Ohio Teacher Evaluation System, Ohio Principal Evaluation System and evaluations of other district staff to determine levels of effectiveness appropriate to improve teaching and learning in the district. (p. 20)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. The human resources office provided administrators with Ohio Teacher Evaluation System and Ohio Principal Evaluation System notebooks, including a specific timeline for completion.
   C. Building status reports are complete to date for the Ohio Principal Evaluation System and Ohio Teacher Evaluation System.
   D. A Certified Employees’ Years of Experience and Certification document by building is available.
   E. The human resources assistant superintendent attended the Ohio 8 effort to work with universities to prepare beginning teachers for the urban teaching environment.
   F. The district participated in the Youngstown State University Career Fair in September.

Youngstown Academic Distress Commission Academic Recovery Plan Status

I. Arrange training sessions for the board in an effort to clarify roles of the board and the professional staff and to eliminate micro-managing actions by the board because micro-managing can slow down or even up-end critical decisions and actions that affect student achievement. Training to be arranged by the Youngstown Academic Distress Commission panel and paid for from district funds. (p. 8)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. The academic distress commission chairman contacted Mark Freeman, an education consultant, about conducting training for the board and the administration. He is now completing one-on-one interviews with board members and administrators.
   C. The consultant will present his recommendations to improve the working relationship between the board and the superintendent in an oral report at the Dec. 9 board meeting.
   D. In an interview, the consultant indicated that the board must decide if it is willing to work on the recommendations and if it needs help implementing them.
   E. The board president said the individual interviews have allowed each board member to “say what is on his/her mind.” The consultant said that board members were given as much time as necessary.

II. Limit the number of paid board meetings to two per month. This limitation will not apply in the event that the board has to hire a superintendent or treasurer. Meetings with search providers, interviewing candidates and Youngstown, deliberating about who should be offered employment, are not subject to the two meetings per month restriction. In addition, this restriction does not apply to board meetings convened for training purposes. (p. 8)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. A spreadsheet provided by the district treasurer indicates that the board of education met
41 times in fiscal year 2012; 36 times in fiscal year 2013; 41 times in fiscal year 2014; and the board has met 20 times to date in fiscal year 2015. There are seven board members who are each paid $125 per meeting.

C. The board president said, “This [being a board member] is not a job.”

D. An article in the Youngstown Vindicator (Oct. 3, 2014) indicated the board met nine times in July 2014.

III. Recommendations about curriculum, instruction and assessment, as well as matters regarding support services for students will be presented by the superintendent to the Youngstown Academic Distress Commission for their approval. (p. 9)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. The board meeting on Aug. 26, 2014, shows that a contract with Thomas Enterprises for the 2014-2015 school year for on-site mental health services was voted down 2-5; at the same meeting a motion to table a contract with D & E Counseling Center for the 2014-2015 school year for in-school suspension students at East High School passed 5-2.

C. Both contracts were approved by the academic distress commission during its meeting on Aug. 28, 2014.

IV. All administrative appointments will be recommended to and approved by the academic distress commission. For the purpose of this Academic Recovery Plan, administrators will be defined as leadership and special assistance positions and whose primary responsibility is the assistance or supervision of adults, not the support and instruction of students, i.e. individuals being offered administrative contracts. (p. 9)

A. The status of the recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. In an article in the Youngstown Vindicator (Oct. 2, 2014), the board president noted that “the commission’s taking over administrative appointments won’t make much difference. They do it anyway.”

C. A central administrator said, “Strategies 3 and 4 in the Academic Recovery Plan will have an impact.” These strategies permit the district superintendent to take recommendations about curriculum, instruction and assessments, as well as all administrative appointments directly to the commission for approval.

V. Develop a communications plan whereby the superintendent provides weekly written updates to all board members and commission members apprising them of key district goals and initiatives, current events and developments, progress toward goal attainment and important new challenges. (p. 9)

A. The status of the recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. In October 2014, the superintendent began providing weekly “Friday Notes” to board members and academic distress commission members. Notes mirror areas of leadership and governance, student support, curriculum, instruction and assessment, data and technology, professional development and fiscal management. Weekly events are included.

C. The district website includes information about all of the buildings, including available programs and serves as a source of current district-wide news.

VI. Review board policy and guidelines regarding who among the board members may speak officially on behalf of the board. If this is unclear in policy or guidelines, determine who will speak officially on behalf of the board and modify the policy to reflect this. (p. 9)

A. The status of this recommendation is “Not in Progress.”

B. No evidence was presented at the time that the mid-year site visit was conducted.
VII. Dedicate at least one of the two monthly board meetings to school building presentations and celebrations of student success. Invite students who will be honored and their families to attend the board meetings when they will be recognized. (p. 9)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. Board minutes indicate that specific building principals have made presentations that highlight programs and students in their respective buildings.
   C. At the November meeting, four student “board members” were named for the year. Student board members make monthly reports to the board about events in their buildings.

VIII. Continue to review board policies to ensure compliance. (p. 9)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. A contracted company provides the guidance for policy compliance.
   C. The board of education has a three-person committee for Certified Personnel/Legal/Legislative/Policy.

CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION
Ohio Department of Education District Report Recommendations

I. Create a team of teachers, administrators and curriculum staff to develop formative and summative assessments. Provide adequate professional development for this team on assessment creation. Implement a yearly assessment calendar for staff, students and the community and include it in the district’s instructional framework document. (p. 20)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. In August 2014, the district began to implement the Battelle for Kids-sponsored Formative Instructional Practices module throughout the district. Formative Instructional Practices training is used to assist building staff in the creation of learning targets to guide instruction and deconstruct Ohio’s New Learning Standards.
   C. With the support of State Support Team 5, building principals and math and literacy coaches are training staff on implementing Formative Instructional Practices modules on district-designated waiver days.
   D. Formative Instructional Practices also are being used to train staff members on documenting and collecting evidence from formative assessments.
   E. During classroom observations, learning targets and Ohio’s New Learning Standards were posted in most classrooms.
   F. A district assessment calendar was created for the 2014-2015 school year and can be found on the district website.

II. Align all district curriculum resources to Ohio’s New Learning Standards. Assure that any curriculum items purchased are aligned with the standards and provide criteria and training to the district staff for such purchases. (p. 20)

   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. Both the Literacy Collaborative and new Carnegie Math programs are aligned to Ohio’s New Learning Standards.
   C. District pacing guides (curriculum maps) have been or are being revised to coordinate with Ohio’s New Learning Standards and present curriculum resources.
III. Provide training for all staff throughout the district on the 5-Step Process. Use the Ohio Leadership Advisory Council’s video series to introduce the concept and contact State Support Team 5 to provide the training at no cost to the district. Provide the building leadership teams and the teacher-based teams meeting times during the school day to regularly use the 5-Step Process. (p. 20)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Teacher-based teams meet twice monthly at various times during the day.
C. Building leadership teams meet monthly at various times during the day.
D. Math and literacy coaches are assigned to building leadership teams and teacher-based teams and attend all meetings.
E. All principals and district coaches have been trained by State Support Team 5 staff in ways to evaluate building leadership team and teacher-based team agendas and meeting minutes.
F. Teacher-based teams and building leadership teams are working on understanding the Ohio Improvement Process and structure, as well as analyzing pre- and post-assessment data.
G. Teacher-based teams and building leadership teams are working on ways to collect and analyze adult implementation data.
H. The 5-Step Process agenda forms are shared with curriculum department leadership.

IV. Use academic monitors to help oversee the academic processes and development in the district and to report findings to the Academic Distress Commission to ensure that the curriculum is being presented with fidelity throughout the district. (p. 20)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Math and literacy coaches have all been assigned one building to work with grades Kindergarten through 8.
C. Curriculum content specialists work with building staffs in grades 9 through 12.
D. Coaches and curriculum staff work with building staffs on implementing and monitoring district initiated programs, as well as Ohio’s New Learning Standards and the Ohio Improvement Process in order to gather and report academic progress to the Academic Distress Commission.

V. Develop a district-wide common set of protocols for in-service training. Implement a monitoring system for supervisors of full-time and part-time literacy and math coaches to ensure consistency in the delivery of their staff development. (p. 20)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The district has developed a district-wide Waiver Day Plan for 2014-2015 that is implemented by building principals and literacy and math coaches.
C. The district has established a calendar of common meeting dates for coaches and curriculum supervisors.
D. Coaches have been working with building staff members on ways to deconstruct Ohio’s New Learning Standards.
E. Coaches and curriculum supervisors have all been trained in Literacy Collaborative and Carnegie Math programs, Formative Instructional Practices and the Ohio Improvement Process so they can assist building staff.

IV. Create a system-wide, monthly calendar to include program initiatives, standardized testing dates, assessments, end-of-quarter and yearly testing dates, Ohio Teacher Evaluation System evaluation deadlines and major personnel or program moves. Appoint a committee to chart, monitor and evaluate both the frequency and amount of assessments throughout the school system and
the movement of programs and personnel due to school closings, new initiatives, budget cuts, reorganization or state and local mandates. Establish a protocol for the addition of new initiatives to include the superintendent and board approval. (p. 20)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The district has developed a monthly assessment calendar that targets all state and local assessments and testing dates and deadlines by grade level.
C. The district has created a document that addresses Student Learning Objectives for 2014-2015 with a timeline of due dates.

Youngstown Academic Distress Commission Academic Recovery Plan Status

I. Create a team of teachers, administrators and curriculum staff to develop formative and summative assessments. Provide adequate professional development for this team on assessment creation. Develop and follow a yearly assessment calendar for staff, students and the community and include it in the district’s instructional framework document. (p. 12)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. In August 2014, the district began to implement the Battelle for Kids Formative Instructional Practices modules districtwide.
C. With the support of State Support Team 5 staff principals and math and literacy coaches are training staff on implementing Formative Instructional Practices modules on district-designated waiver days.
D. Formative Instructional Practices also are being used to train staff members on documenting and collecting evidence from formative assessments.
E. A district assessment calendar was created for the 2014-2015 school year and is located on the district’s website.

II. Align all district resources to Ohio’s New Learning Standards, and assure that any curriculum items purchased are aligned with the standards. Provide training to the district staff whenever new curriculum resources are purchased. (p. 12)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Both the Literacy Collaborative and new Carnegie Math programs are aligned to Ohio’s New Learning Standards.
C. District pacing guides (curriculum maps) have been or are being revised to coordinate with Ohio’s New Learning Standards and present curriculum resources.

III. Appoint a committee to chart, monitor and evaluate both the frequency and number of assessments throughout the school year. (p. 12)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The district has developed a district-wide Waiver Day Plan for 2014-2015 that is implemented by building principals and literacy and math coaches.
C. The district established a calendar of meeting dates for coaches and curriculum supervisors.
D. Coaches have been working with building staffs on ways to deconstruct Ohio’s New Learning Standards and create formative assessments.
E. Coaches and curriculum supervisors have all been trained in Literacy Collaborative, Carnegie Math, Formative Instructional Practices and the Ohio Improvement Process.
F. Curriculum department leadership and curriculum supervisors meet regularly to review assessments throughout the district.
IV. Provide training for all staff throughout the district on the 5-Step Process. Use the Ohio Leadership Advisory Council video series to introduce the concept and contact the State Support Team 5 to provide training at no cost to the district. The building leadership teams and teacher-based teams should meet during the school day to allow for regular use of the 5-Step Process. (p. 12)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Building teacher-based teams meet twice monthly at various times during the day.
C. Building leadership teams meet monthly at various times during the day.
D. Math and literacy coaches are assigned to building leadership teams and teacher-based teams and attend all meetings.
E. Forms for the 5-Step Process are used for building leadership team and teacher-based team meetings and are shared with the director of curriculum and his staff.
F. Teacher-based teams and building leadership teams are working on collecting and analyzing adult implementation data.
G. Principals have been trained by the State Support Team 5 staff in ways to evaluate building leadership team and teacher-based team agendas and meeting minutes.
H. Teacher-based teams and building leadership teams are working on understanding the Ohio Improvement Process and structure, as well as pre- and post-analyses of data.
I. Some building staff members have viewed the Ohio Leadership Advisory Council videos to learn how to have more focused teacher-based team and building leadership team meetings.

V. Continue to use academic monitors to help oversee the academic processes and development in the district and to report findings to the Youngstown Academic Distress Commission to ensure that the curriculum is being presented with fidelity and instruction and is reaching all students effectively. (p. 13)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Academic monitors are now working at the K-8 and 9-12 grade levels.
C. Coaches and curriculum supervisors have been trained in the Literacy Collaborative, Carnegie Math, Formative Instructional Practices, Ohio Improvement Process and School City.
D. Academic monitors, instructional coaches and curriculum supervisors meet on an ongoing basis to provide both written and on-site feedback to the curriculum department and district leadership.
E. Curriculum content supervisors work with grades 9-12 building staff on implementing district initiatives.
F. Math and literacy coaches are each assigned to one K-8 building to implement district Literacy Collaborative and new Carnegie Math programs.

ASSESSMENT AND USE OF DATA
Ohio Department of Education District Report Recommendations

I. Expect that all teachers should use student- and classroom-level reports available in SchoolCity to inform instruction. Make ProgressBook® modules available for students and parents in all schools, and monitor to make sure parents and students are using the system. Provide training for teachers in understanding and using Value-Added information. (p. 21)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Coaches are monitoring teacher assessments in SchoolCity. However, according to the coaches, teacher use of SchoolCity is not consistent across the district. The curriculum director also shared that teachers are not utilizing SchoolCity to the degree expected and are not using the SchoolCity assessment reports during teacher-based team meetings. Teachers in the focus group indicated that they can pull reports from SchoolCity and that the reports are easy to interpret.
C. Parents and students have been given access to ProgressBook®. One principal stated that parents have been shown how to use the ProgressBook® application on their phones. About 80 percent of parents in the focus group have heard of ProgressBook®, but only 40 percent are using the parent module. One parent commented how she loves ProgressBook®. She can see current grades, missing assignments and student attendance. Not all students in the focus group were aware that they have access to ProgressBook®. One student in the focus group indicated that ProgressBook® is not accurate until the day before the report cards are released. One student stated that Cheney students are required to use ProgressBook® and the data is always accurate.

D. The district has not yet provided Value-Added training to teachers. The deputy superintendent indicated that one option considered would be to give teachers stipends for completing the Battelle for Kids online Value-Added modules. Only three teachers in the focus group received a Value-Added report. The teachers indicated that they understood their reports “for the most part.”

II. Ensure that available technology is sufficient to administer online assessments. Conduct an audit of electronic instructional tools and make repairs and purchases to meet classroom needs. (p. 21)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. According to principals, about half of their staff members are using Promethean boards in the classroom. Students in the focus group also indicated that they like using the computers and 3D printer in engineering. However, another principal stated that some teachers are afraid of technology and therefore don’t use it in the classroom. Grades 3-6 teachers are still receiving ProgressBook® training to learn how to enter grades consistently. Only about 50 percent of teachers are comfortable with all of the available features in ProgressBook®.

C. The deputy superintendent stated that two laptop stations, each with 30 computers, have been delivered to all elementary buildings and any Discovery programs that were deficient in technology. The technology coordinator also stated that the newest computers are sent to the labs and that eventually all older lab computers in the district will be replaced this year. In addition, servers were purchased for every building so that students can recapture work if a computer freezes. According to the technology coordinator, “all classrooms should have computers. On average, there should be one computer for every five students.” The district is currently evaluating wireless capability in the buildings so that students can take the PARCC tests on laptops. This year, the district implemented a five-year replacement plan for computers.

D. According to principals, computers are used daily by students in some schools. Students in the focus group confirmed this. Carnegie math has a computer component so students receiving this math curriculum are in the computer lab once a week. Parents and students voiced that specialty schools have more access to computers and technology than other schools, such as East and University Project Learning Center. According to parents, students only use computers on Friday at one school, whereas at another school (Cheney), students use computers every day. The curriculum director also has heard that computer availability is not equitable across high schools, and at East, there is a need for working computers. However, the curriculum director has not yet confirmed this for himself. Students in the focus group indicated that technology in the classroom is operable approximately 66 percent of the time.

E. According to the deputy superintendent, the district has enough computers and the capacity to do all testing online. However, parents are concerned that their children are going to take the PARCC assessments online because they believe that students do not have equal access to computers. Students in the focus group also realize that they will take a test on the computer in the spring and are concerned because they are not getting to practice on the computers. Some parents indicated that computer use is minimal. Parents consider the lack of technology available to students to be a district challenge.
III. Encourage members of the executive cabinet to attend building-level and teacher-based team meetings (in rotation) to observe how the meetings are conducted and make recommendations to improve the process. (p. 21)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. The deputy superintendent indicated that as building leadership team and teacher-based team meetings were monitored during walkthroughs, it became evident that the 5-step Ohio Improvement Process was not being used. The curriculum director added that there was a communication issue between what central office planned and what was actually communicated to teachers. As a result, principals are receiving training from the state support team on how to evaluate teacher-based team meetings, outcomes and action steps. Principals also received training during the district’s summer retreat and district leadership team meetings.

C. One school principal offered professional development to his staff on how to run teacher-based team meetings. A principal indicated that she sits on as many teacher-based team meetings as she can. Another principal shared that teachers are surveyed at the end of the teacher-based team meetings to understand what is working and what needs to be changed operationally. A teacher who is part of the district leadership team, building leadership team and teacher-based team indicated that her building principal documents whether adult implementation is actually evident. Another district leadership team member stated that the principal reviews the teacher-based team minutes to make sure that what was to be implemented has been executed. According to the curriculum director, curriculum supervisors also are monitoring the teacher-based teams and collect the majority of the data. However, coaches indicated there is still a lack of consistency across the district as to how teacher-based teams operate.

D. There is a district-wide push to improve the ‘adult implementation’ section of the teacher-based team process. According to the coaches, teachers are getting better at interpreting data and creating strategies to improve. Principals also stated that teacher-based teams are using formative assessment data to develop new strategies. A district leadership team member indicated that teacher-based teams review formative and summative data, extended responses and student learning objectives during their meetings. Teachers also are making progress on implementing strategies. According to one principal, teachers are looking at student data to see if the strategies they implemented are working. Teachers in the focus group confirmed that they are looking at data to see what needs to be improved.

IV. Focus on using the assessments formatively, as originally intended. Provide professional development for teachers on how to create “testlets” in SchoolCity to check for understanding after an intervention. (p. 21)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. According to the curriculum director, district-wide professional development in using Battelle for Kids online Formative Instructional Practices modules in math and reading has been initiated. Teachers in the focus group indicated that they turned in transcripts to show that they completed the online Formative Instructional Practices module.

C. District-wide professional development on how to use SchoolCity was given to teachers, but, according to the teachers, the training was minimal and not enough. Coaches are providing additional training to show teachers how to enter assessments in SchoolCity. The curriculum director and Technology Coordinator indicated that teachers known as “SYOPS” are available in the schools to help with SchoolCity troubleshooting. However, coaches indicated that primary language arts and math grades are not using SchoolCity to administer formative assessments.
D. Coaches indicated that some teachers are using Rapid Response Tests (a SchoolCity tool) as short cycle assessments. According to the curriculum director, approximately 50 percent of the grades 7-12 teachers are creating assessments in SchoolCity for student learning objectives. Less than half of the coaches are satisfied with the level of SchoolCity usage by teachers. Coaches stated that SchoolCity is not beneficial for English language arts because it is time consuming. Teachers indicated that SchoolCity is not user-friendly and the printers and computers do not always work.

Youngstown Academic Distress Commission Academic Recovery Plan Status
I. Expect that all teachers use student and classroom-level reports available in SchoolCity to inform instruction. Make ProgressBook® modules available for students and parents in all schools, and monitor to make sure parents and students are using the system. (p. 13)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. Coaches are monitoring teacher assessments in SchoolCity. However, according to the coaches, teacher use of SchoolCity is not consistent across the district. The curriculum director also shared that teachers are not utilizing SchoolCity to the degree expected, and are not using the SchoolCity assessment reports during teacher-based team meetings. Teachers in the focus group indicated that they can pull reports from SchoolCity and that the reports are easy to interpret.

C. Parents and students have been given access to ProgressBook®. One principal stated that parents have been shown how to use the ProgressBook® application on their phones. About 80 percent of parents in the focus group have heard of ProgressBook®, but only 40 percent are using the parent module. One parent commented how she loves ProgressBook®. She can see current grades, missing assignments and student attendance. Not all students in the focus group were aware that they have access to ProgressBook®. One student in the focus group indicated that ProgressBook® is not accurate until the day before the report cards are released. One student stated that Cheney students are required to use ProgressBook® and the data is always accurate.

II. Provide training for teachers in understanding and using Value-Added information to critique their own success in helping students realize a year or more of growth each year they are in school. (p. 13)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. Though the district has not yet provided Value-Added training to all teachers, district administration indicated that one option considered would be to give teachers stipends for completing the Battelle for Kids online Value-Added modules for greater participation.

C. The teachers in the focus group who received a Value-Added report, indicated that they understood their reports “for the most part.”

III. Assure that available technology is sufficient to administer online assessments. Conduct an audit of electronic instructional tools and make repairs and purchases to meet classroom needs. (p. 13)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. According to principals, about half of their staff members are using Promethean boards in the classroom. Students in the focus group also indicated that they like using the computers and 3D printer in engineering. However, another principal stated that some teachers are afraid of technology and therefore don’t use it in the classroom. Grades 3-6 teachers are still receiving ProgressBook® training to learn how to enter grades consistently. Only about 50 percent of teachers are comfortable with all of the available features in ProgressBook®.

C. The deputy superintendent stated that two laptop stations, each with 30 computers, have been delivered to all elementary buildings and any Discovery programs that were deficient
in technology. The technology coordinator also stated that the newest computers are sent to the labs and that eventually all older lab computers in the district will be replaced this year. In addition, servers were purchased for every building so that students can recapture work if a computer freezes. All classrooms should have computers. On average, there should be one computer for every five students. The district is currently evaluating wireless capability in the buildings so that students can take the PARCC tests on laptops. This year the district implemented a five-year replacement plan for computers.

D. According to principals, computers are used daily by students in some schools. Students in the focus group confirmed this. Carnegie math has a computer component so students receiving this math curriculum are in the computer lab once a week. Parents and students voiced that specialty schools have more access to computers and technology than other schools, such as East and University Project Learning Center. According to parents, students only use computers on Friday at one school, whereas at another school (Cheney), students use computers every day. The curriculum director also has heard that computer availability is not equitable across high schools, and at East, there is a need for working computers. However, the curriculum director has not yet confirmed this for himself. Students in the focus group indicated that technology in the classroom is operable approximately 66 percent of the time.

E. According to the deputy superintendent, the district has enough computers and the capacity to do all testing online. However, parents are concerned that their children are going to take the PARCC assessments online because they believe that students do not have equal access to computers. Students in the focus group also realize that they will take a test on the computer in the spring and are concerned because they are not getting to practice on the computers. Some parents indicated that computer use is minimal. Parents consider the lack of technology available to students to be a district challenge.

IV. Executive cabinet and central office staff should attend building and teacher-based team meetings to observe how the meetings are conducted and make recommendations as necessary to improve the practice. (p. 13)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. The deputy superintendent indicated that as building leadership team and teacher-based team meetings were monitored during walkthroughs, it became evident that the 5-step Ohio Improvement Process was not being used. The curriculum director added that there was a communication issue between what central office planned and what was actually communicated to teachers. As a result, principals are receiving training from the state support team on how to evaluate teacher-based team meetings, outcomes and action steps. Principals also received training during the district’s summer retreat and district leadership team meetings.

C. One school principal offered professional development to his staff on how to run teacher-based team meetings. A principal indicated that she sits on as many teacher-based team meetings as she can. Another principal shared that teachers are surveyed at the end of the teacher-based team meetings to understand what is working and what needs to be changed operationally. A teacher who is part of the district leadership team, building leadership team and teacher-based team indicated that her building principal documents whether adult implementation is actually evident. Another district leadership team member stated that the principal reviews the teacher-based team minutes to make sure that what was to be implemented has been executed. According to the curriculum director, curriculum supervisors also are monitoring the teacher-based teams and collect the majority of the data. However, coaches indicated there is still a lack of consistency across the district as to how teacher-based teams operate.

D. There is a district-wide push to improve the ‘adult implementation’ section of the teacher-based team process. According to the coaches, teachers are getting better at interpreting data
and creating strategies to improve. Principals also stated that teacher-based teams are using formative assessment data to develop new strategies. A district leadership team member indicated that teacher-based teams review formative and summative data, extended responses and student learning objectives during their meetings. Teachers also are making progress on implementing strategies. According a one principal, teachers are looking at student data to see if the strategies they implemented are working. Teachers in the focus group confirmed that they are looking at data to see what needs to be improved.

HUMAN RESOURCES AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Ohio Department of Education District Report Recommendations

I. Create, distribute and implement a clear and concise district personnel goal plan for Youngstown City Schools showing, at-a-glance by school, the personnel categories, experience, certification and National Board Certified teachers of the staff. Include goal statements for balanced building staffs in terms of years of experience and certification levels. (p. 21)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The district human resources department has printed the “Certificated Employees’ Years of Experience and Certification Book for 2014-2015” by building, for the entire school system, which includes designations of National Board Certified Teachers and Master Teachers.
C. According to board minutes of Oct. 2, 2014, the human resources director presented a handout on staff trends from 2013-2014 to 2014-2015 school years to the school board.

II. Conduct exit interviews for all teaching and administrative employees who leave the school district for reasons other than termination or as a “Reduction in Force” to determine their reasons for leaving the district and whether or not they will be employed in another school district. Use the data from the brief exit interviews to inform opportunities for improvements within the buildings and the district. (p. 21)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. An exit Interview form has been developed by the human resources department.
C. Exit interviews will be conducted beginning in the spring/summer of 2015 to all staff leaving the district for reasons other than staff reduction/firings according to human resources officials.

III. Develop a yearly professional development calendar. Include all district-determined professional development and state-sponsored professional development, such as Response to Intervention, Universal Design for Learning and Formative Instructional Practices. Survey staff regularly to assess their professional development needs and include those on the calendar as well. Solicit the assistance of State Support Team 5 to determine training they are able to provide to the district at no cost. (p. 21)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. A professional development plan was created by the district management for all administrative and teaching staff. The district plan was presented and distributed to building administrators at the Aug. 18, 2014 Administrator Leadership Academy.
C. Participants in the principal and teacher focus groups both verified that a system-wide professional development calendar is printed and being implemented in the schools throughout the district focusing mainly on the Carnegie Math Program, Ohio Teacher Evaluation System and Literacy Collaborative.
D. According to the Oct. 2, 2014 board minutes, the human resources director handed out information to the board on the Ohio Teacher/Principal Evaluation System Monitoring. The director stated that training was held on Aug. 18, 2014, with all administrators who conduct evaluations in the district. The purpose was to clarify the process and timelines for evaluations.
IV. Establish a protocol outlining when and how administrators and staff members will be reassigned. Allow the district’s central office staff, administrators and teachers to create a stable system for determining criteria for district moves. Create a timeline for school improvement with measurable annual objectives. Review the information cited in the Quaglia Institute Impact Report to the district regarding school improvement efforts, which states, “most experts agree that - especially when change to a school culture, staff morale, community outlook etc., is part of an improvement effort - three to five years is not an unrealistic term in which to realize outcomes.” (p. 22)

A. The status of this recommendation is “Not in Progress.”

B. Due to the addition of Volney and East Discovery schools creating 19.5 new positions and a large number of staff vacancies, 95 new staff were hired for the 2014-2015 school year.

C. Six teaching positions still remain vacant throughout the district and a major complaint stated in both the teacher and administrator focus groups was “too few substitutes are available to fill daily occurring staff absentee vacancies throughout the district.”

Youngstown Academic Distress Commission Academic Recovery Plan Status

I. Create, distribute and implement a clear and concise district personnel goal plan for the district showing, at-a-glance by school, the personnel categories, experience, licenses required and National Board Certification/Highly Qualified Teacher statuses. (p. 14)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. A district personnel plan was written and presented to the board of education and the academic distress commission in August 2014, according to board minutes.

C. A District Personnel Experience and Certification Book was printed in 2014 showing by school building, the staff, their assignments, certifications and years of experience.

D. The Resident Educator Program also has a schedule for new teachers in the district. According to the master schedule, meetings were held in September and October of 2014 and more are scheduled throughout the upcoming school year. Mentors are assigned to each resident educator.

II. Join networks that attempt to recruit minority teachers to work in urban districts, and participate in recruitment events at historically black colleges and universities (HBCUs) in an effort to hire minority teachers and administrators. (p. 14)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. According to proof of registration and the program agenda on Nov. 10, 2014, the district’s human resources staff participated in the Ohio College and University Recruitment Summit sponsored by the Ohio 8 group to discuss ways to recruit minority teachers to work in urban areas.

C. Statements by the human resources staff indicated that more recruiting communication and possible site visits to historically historically black colleges and universities may be forthcoming, although none currently are evident.

D. Job Fairs were conducted in Columbus, Ohio, with the Ohio 8 on March 8, 2014, at Youngstown State University on March 24, 2014, and with the Affordable Healthcare Committee on May 24, 2014.
III. Conduct exit interviews for all teaching and administrative staff who leave the school district (for reasons other than termination, retirement or “reduction in force”) to determine their reasons for leaving the district and whether they are leaving for employment in another school district. Use the data from the exit interviews to inform strategies for improvement within the district or buildings. (p. 14)

A. The current status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The human resources staff created an online exit interview that will begin to be utilized in the Spring/Summer of 2015, according to interview statements made by the director.
C. The program has already been installed online through “Access.”

IV. Appoint a district personnel committee to monitor the movement of personnel due to school closings, new initiatives, budgetary cuts, reorganization, or state and local mandates. (p. 15)

A. The current status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. A district personnel committee already has been established that includes the superintendent, deputy superintendent, executive director of special education, director of adult education and chief of business.
C. Findings will be shared with senior staff by March of each year and will be used to inform hiring needs for the upcoming year.

V. Monitor Ohio Teacher Evaluation System and Ohio Principal Evaluation System processes, and track the completion of evaluations quarterly. Present reports of the status of evaluation compliance quarterly to the board of education and the Academic Distress Commission panel at the November, February and May meetings. (p. 15)

A. The current status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. An online, up-to-the-minute system of recording Ohio Teacher Evaluation System and Ohio Principal Evaluation System evaluations is monitored weekly by the district human resources department staff.
C. Training on the Ohio Teacher Evaluation System was held with all the district administrators who conduct evaluations in the district on Aug. 18, 2014. This was according to principal focus group interviewees and documents provided by the human resources department.
D. The district human resources staff provided administrators with Ohio Teacher Evaluation System and Ohio Principal Evaluation System notebooks that included specific timelines for completion.
E. Both teacher and principal focus groups admitted that the Ohio Teacher Evaluation System process is underway in each building represented.

VI. Create and distribute a district-wide professional development calendar and monitor the calendar. Conduct quick satisfaction surveys after each professional development session. (p. 15)

A. The current status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. A district professional development calendar has been distributed to all schools within the district.
C. Following each professional development activity, an online survey is distributed and collected according to administrative staff during interviews.
STUDENT SUPPORTS
Ohio Department of Education District Report Recommendations

I. Employ the Positive Student Support Team process to follow the best practices of the Response to Intervention/Multi-Tiered System of Support. Utilize the state support team and educational service center for training and support. Review and consult online resources such as www.interventioncentral.org and other resources for tiered intervention strategies to develop a framework with multiple levels of support for students and families. (p. 22)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Interviews indicated that the Multi-Tiered System of Support was implemented one month ago at two elementary schools and that the Multi-Tiered System of Support does not include the Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports framework. It was stated that the district was not “that far” with the Multi-Tiered System of Support.
C. An interviewee stated the district recognized interventions were not tiered, and the district distributed an academic intervention document that listed Tiers 1, 2 and 3 intervention strategies to building leadership teams.
D. It was reported by a building principal that they were working on implementing Response to Intervention in the classrooms, and literacy coaches were sharing research-based interventions with teachers.
E. Central office personnel outlined new objectives for tiered interventions and other Response to Intervention best practices to staff via a PowerPoint presentation.

II. Fully implement the Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports framework to include training, support and resources. Use the framework as part of the Multi-Tiered System of Support and align with Quaglia Aspirations framework to support positive behavior and improve school climate. Utilize the state support team and educational service center for training and support. According to a recent Hanover Research Report on “Disciplinary Alternatives to Suspension” (June 2014), school-wide implementation of Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports has significant positive effects in lowering numbers of suspensions, office referrals and observed problem behaviors. Review and consult PBIS.org for specific training modules and resources to support implementation of Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports. (p. 22)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. District personnel stated the district was in the early stages with implementing the Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports framework.
C. Guidelines and procedures for the Positive Student Support Team were published, and a Positive Student Support Team procedure effectiveness evaluation team was formed in September 2014.
D. Central office personnel and State Support Team 5 members conducted a Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports development meeting in October 2014. A Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports fact sheet and three-year implementation plan were listed on the agenda. A plan for implementation of the crosswalk with Quaglia Framework also was listed as a discussion item for the November 2014 PBIS meeting.
E. The district conducted a needs assessment of positive student support team procedures and reported 75 percent of respondents answered they were very knowledgeable about the Positive Student Support Team process and 25 percent indicated they were somewhat knowledgeable of the Positive Student Support Team. When rating the effectiveness of the current Positive Student Support Team process, 75 percent of respondents indicated the process was very effective and 25 percent noted the process was somewhat effective. When asked to rate the level of change needed within the five areas of the Positive Student Support Team process, respondents indicated the three-tier intervention process needed significant change.
F. The district formed a Positive Student Support Team at W. H. McGuffey and Williamson Elementary Schools. A teacher leader, speech pathologist, community leader, principal, vice principal, nurse, data specialist, community-based counseling agency counselor (D & E Counseling), guidance counselor and two interns from Youngstown State University’s psychology department were listed as Positive Student Support Team members.

G. Two Positive Student Support Team meetings were held on Oct. 9 and 16, 2014 at W.H. McGuffey Elementary School. Several team members were not present at the meetings.

H. A district principal noted that professional development for Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports started in his building last year with the teaching staff performing self-evaluations.

I. An elementary building principal provided a Positive Student Support Team referral packet on a student that included academic and behavioral concerns. The Positive Student Support Team referral packet included initial referral documents, a learning and behavior plan, work samples, student data and documented student observations.

J. Interviewees did not indicate that PBIS.org training modules were used as a resource to support the implementation of Positive Behavior Interventions and Supports. It also was stated in an interview that the district did not offer Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports professional development to staff.

III. Establish a committee to review the Quaglia outcome data and begin planning for the next phase after the demonstration project ends. (p. 22)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. Central office personnel reported the next step for continuing the Quaglia Aspirations Framework is the crosswalk with Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports. A committee is scheduled to convene in January 2015 to provide a rollout plan for the district. It was noted that the district is planning to start with its five elementary schools first.

C. Several principals stated their buildings have active Quaglia teams and meet with students on a weekly or bi-monthly basis, depending on the teams and/or buildings. One building listed student Quaglia teams for grades 3-6. Each team was comprised of six students.

D. Interviewed teachers noted district buildings are at different Quaglia implementation phases. Harding Elementary School achieved a Top School Project Aspire certificate for the first quarter. Youngstown Early College and Wilson Discovery Schools have not started the Quaglia Aspirations Framework.

E. Some representative responses from staff interviews concerning Quaglia included:
   1. “The [Quaglia Program professional development] game [requires one to] read articles from Quaglia, comment on two questions, and buy the book.”
   2. “The purpose of the game is to learn about Quaglia.”
   3. “[There is a] waiting period for Quaglia to impact schools; it is a Band-Aid at the middle school level.”
   4. “We go over student surveys with staff and teacher surveys; no one from central office reads surveys.”
   5. “[There is a] system problem: give people the support they need to learn, modify and retool.”
   6. “The biggest issue is time; we have initiative fatigue.”
IV. Develop a process to collect and evaluate outcome data to assess the impact of all student support programs and community/agency partnership services. (p. 22)

A. No status given for this recommendation.
B. Due primarily to a short window of time for the district review, this recommendation made in the May, 2014 Ohio Department of Education District Report was not addressed during the district review team site visit on Nov. 19-21, 2014, and will be further studied and assessed during the district review team site visit in May 2015.

V. Conduct resource mapping of internal and external supports and resources to provide alignment of series and easier access for staff and families. Explore resources from the UCLA Mental Health in Schools website at http://smhp.psych.ucla.edu/ for resource mapping tools and additional information on developing a comprehensive continuum of support for students and families. (p. 22)

A. The status of this recommendation is “Not in Progress.”
B. No evidence was presented at the time that the mid-year site visit was conducted.

VI. Repurpose or hire staff to assist with visiting teacher responsibilities. (p. 22)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. There is one visiting teacher instead of four. The visiting teacher is a licensed social worker who is responsible for monitoring student absences. The visiting teacher works with the juvenile court system and community support services for habitually absent students.
C. A district Student Services Manual was provided. The manual contained information and forms regarding student enrollment, discipline and attendance protocols.

VII. Convene a committee to review school choice acceptance criteria and develop a plan to be more inclusive of all students. (p. 22)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. No evidence was presented at the time of the mid-year site visit indicating that a committee had convened.
C. Central office personnel stated the district does not have any waiting lists for student placements into specialized programs. STEM, Visual and Performing Arts and Youngstown Early College have the greatest restrictions based on student grades and attendance.
D. It was stated that the current appeals process included student support personnel meeting with principals to discuss program acceptance criteria. The district is planning to include a formal appeals process on student applications for the 2015-2016 school year.
E. During review team interviews, it was revealed that 50 percent of the students accepted at Volney Discovery School did not meet the acceptance criteria yet were accepted this year.

Youngstown Academic Distress Commission Academic Recovery Plan Status

I. Continue the work of the Quaglia Institute for Student Aspirations program coordinated by the Quaglia Institute. Develop buy-in on the basic tenets of the program from all staff in schools where Quaglia Institute for Student Aspirations is being used. Expand the Quaglia Institute for Student Aspirations program to more schools in the district. Establish a committee to review the Quaglia outcome data. (p. 10)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Quaglia Institute for Student Aspirations framework has been implemented at varying levels in district buildings except for one school. Some district buildings are implementing Quaglia Institute for Student Aspirations for the first time, while other district schools are in year three.
C. Teachers stated that Quaglia Institute for Student Aspirations meetings were held. Student and staff surveys were completed along with Quaglia Institute for Student Aspirations modules.

D. Teachers stated it was hard to get a Quaglia leader in every grade because of the training process.

II. Fully implement the Positive Behavior Interventions and Supports framework in all schools. Establish systems of supports to include strategies for defining, teaching and supporting appropriate student behaviors to create positive school environments. (p. 10)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. Central office personnel initiated a three-year Positive Behavior Interventions and Supports implementation timeline.

C. The district formed Positive Behavior Interventions and Supports teams at two elementary schools.

D. It was stated that the next step is to incorporate Quaglia Aspirations Framework Crosswalk with Positive Behavior Interventions and Supports.

III. Foster the belief that all students can learn when they are meaningfully challenged and skillfully supported. Establish the expectation that every adult’s primary purpose for working in the Youngstown City School District is to help all students achieve at high levels. (p. 10)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. A principal in the district stated that a rigorous curriculum is aligned and in place; however, high teacher and student mobility impedes student achievement.

C. School district personnel indicated that a culture of placing students in the most restrictive setting first still exists within the district.

D. Large class size was cited as a barrier in helping students achieve at high levels. It also was stated that central office goes by the number of students in a class not by the make-up of students in the class.

E. Teachers stated the PARCC tests are rigorous, and students are going to “melt down” because they do not have the tools or framework from which to work. However, teachers have been given the instructional framework necessary to prepare the students.

F. The notion that kids with talent enroll at Chaney High School and all other kids go to East High School exists within the student population.

IV. Celebrate student and staff achievements publicly and frequently, either at board meetings or in other public venues (e.g., Chamber of Commerce meetings, service organization meetings such as Rotary or Kiwanis Clubs, or parent-teacher organization meetings). (p. 10)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. A district school partnered with United Methodist Community Services and conducts a yearly assembly for students at the end of the year.

C. Staff and students were recognized at board of education meetings and in district newsletters.

D. District buildings sponsor programs that focus on student and community relationships, such as breakfast with grandparents, donuts with dad, muffins with mom, and math/literacy nights.

E. Academic Olympics provided students with recognition for grades and attendance in the form of gold, silver and bronze awards. Parents were invited to attend the assembly.

F. Morning meetings were conducted at one elementary school where students also are recognized for behavior, grades and attendance.
V. Monitor suspension and expulsion data monthly at the building level and quarterly at the district level. (p. 10)
   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. Suspension and expulsion reports are provided to the district superintendent on a monthly basis.
   C. The district discusses suspension data at district and building leadership team meetings.
   D. Daily suspension data is reported to building leaders.

VI. Celebrate the ethnic diversity and multi-cultural richness of students, the community and staff. Provide all staff with professional development on the value of diversity and multi-culturalism and the importance and appreciation for the demographic diversity of the classroom, communication practices, instructional practices, relevant content and classroom management techniques that work most effectively with diverse populations of students related to race, ethnicity, culture, socio-economic status and ability levels. (p. 10)
   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. It was reported that professional development on the value of diversity was part of the district’s Positive Behavior Interventions and Supports training.
   C. Professional development targeting diversity training was offered to four district schools.
   D. Parent community liaisons are available to staff and community members.
   E. State Support Team 5 provided professional development to staff on inclusionary instructional practices.
   F. Visiting teachers were trained on mental health issues through Belmont Pines Mental Health facility and the Juvenile Justice Center.

VII. Continue to implement a staff recognition plan that will recognize and celebrate staff for achievement and performance, including leadership excellence at all levels of the organization. (p. 10)
   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. Although no formal staff recognition plan was presented at the time of the mid-year site visit, evidence showed that staff members were recognized at board of education meetings and in district newsletters.

VIII. Conduct resource mapping of internal and external supports and resources to provide alignment of services and easier access for staff and families. Explore resources from UCLA Mental Health in Schools website (http://smhp.psych.ucla.edu/) for resource mapping tools and additional information on developing a continuum of support for students and families. (p. 10)
   A. The status of this recommendation is “Not in Progress.”
   B. No evidence was presented at the time that the mid-year site visit was conducted.

IX. Convene a committee to review school choice acceptance criteria and develop a plan to be more inclusive of all students. (p. 10)
   A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
   B. The district is planning to include a formal appeals process on student applications for the 2015-2016 school year.
   C. There was no evidence that a committee was established to review school choice acceptance criteria and to develop a student-inclusive plan.
X. Refine the practices of the district leadership team, building leadership teams and teacher-based teams to promote staff modeling of professional behaviors that support student achievement. Make distributed leadership the primary purpose of these professional learning communities, not allowing them to devolve into gripe sessions or sessions where the primary accomplishment is “admiring the problem.” (p. 10-11)

A. No status given for this recommendation.

B. Due primarily to a short window of time for the district review, this recommendation made in the May, 2014 Ohio Department of Education District Report was not addressed during the district review team site visit on Nov. 19-21, 2014, and will be further studied and assessed during the district review team site visit in May 2015.

FISCAL MANAGEMENT
Ohio Department of Education District Report Recommendations

I. Include the district’s goals and objectives, criteria of how budget decisions were made and budget details by building in the district’s annual budget and budget presentation. Include building staff and administrators in the preparation process. (p. 23)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. The treasurer indicated that he is in the concept/planning stage for how the Fiscal Year 2016 budget process, documentation and public presentation will best present the district’s goals, objectives and criteria for budget decisions, by building and department level, and how staff and administrators will be given more input into the preparation process. Further, he has completed an outline of the FY16 budget steps and timeline, which appears reasonable, methodical and provides for the following:
   1. Addresses the districts projected deficit in FY16 of $2 million;
   2. Provides for a revised draft FY16 forecast in early April 2015, which will reflect the district’s current financial status after making adjustments to resolve the forecasted $2 million deficit;
   3. Realigns staffing and total number of positions to comply with the Academic Recovery Plan and budgetary constraints;
   4. Finalizes curriculum and technology purchase plans for General Fund as well as Title funds; and
   5. Finalizes capital spending plans for Funds 001, 003 and 034.

II. Survey the parents of Youngstown students attending other districts and schools to determine what changes, if any, in the ridership criteria would bring their children back to the district. Based on the survey results, prepare a cost and benefit analysis to determine what the impact of the different proposed changes would be to the district finances. (p. 23)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. The district sent out a survey to more than 2,700 parents between Nov. 10 and 11, 2014.

C. Responses are beginning to come in and more are expected.

D. A report will be completed prior to the end of January 2015 and an analysis is expected to be completed prior to the March 2015 deadline.
III. Analyze why district spending is so much higher than its comparable districts. Review operations and spending to determine areas that can be reduced without impacting students. Make changes in operations accordingly. (p. 23)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The treasurer’s review has isolated the largest area of variance with other urban districts as the cost of health care.
   1. The district is currently paying nearly $5,000 per student for health care costs as compared to the total cost per pupil in 2013 of $16,493.
   2. The district’s health care consultant told the treasurer that the district has the highest health care costs per plan of any district in Ohio.
C. The treasurer is beginning discussions with the bargaining units to see what can be done to bring these costs down.
D. A written analysis is in process.

IV. Continue implementing changes in the design of accounting systems and work flow and checks and balances, and improve internal control to help catch and correct errors and improve communication. Provide appropriate training to staff on accounting systems changes and include the superintendent. (p. 23)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. A final report was received by the district from their consultants, Plante Moran, regarding recommendations to improve financial operations. Completion of the Plante Moran report recommendations will satisfy this recommendation.
C. The treasurer has begun implementation of the following two recommendations:
   1. Realignment of purchase order and accounts payable duties from the business office to the treasurer’s office; and
   2. Realignment of payroll operations into specialized areas of certificated and non-certificated staff.
D. The treasurer is engaging an outside consultant to provide training for payroll and accounts payable staff.

V. Prepare an analysis for Fund 34 on an annual basis and determine when required resources will be insufficient to meet the district’s capital plan. Prepare a plan of options to address future unfunded capital needs to present to the board. The Ohio School Facilities Commission recognizes that many districts are unable to fully fund their capital plan with only one half of a mill of taxation on an annual basis. This would be especially true of districts that have a very low assessed tax value per pupil, which is the case for Youngstown. (p. 23)

A. The status of this recommendation is “Not in Progress.”
B. The district is aware that funding is insufficient to provide for long-term needs, when a significant portion of buildings and equipment begin to fail and need to be replaced
C. Page seven of the executive summary of the district’s maintenance business plan contains the following recommendation made by the district’s consultants: “The district needs to identify a means to set aside funds for the annual capital renewal budget. Monies set aside each year will minimize the impact the district will experience when the funds are required.”
Youngstown Academic Distress Commission Academic Recovery Plan Status

I. Include the district’s and buildings’ goals in the decision-making process relative to establishing the district and school annual budgets. Where feasible, include building staff and administrators in the budget preparation process. (p. 16)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The treasurer indicated that he is in the concept/planning stage.

II. Survey the parents of Youngstown students attending schools in other districts and who have exercised educational choice options to determine if changes to the district’s transportation criteria would bring their children back to the district. Based on the survey results, prepare a cost and benefit analysis to determine what impact possible changes could bring to district finances. (p. 16)

A. The status of this recommendation “In Progress.”
B. The district sent out the survey and responses are being received.

III. Analyze the district’s per pupil spending to determine how much the district spends per pupil compared to similar districts. Review operations and spending to determine areas that can be reduced without compromising student programs. Propose changes in operations appropriately. (p. 16)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. Treasurer has isolated the largest area of variance with other urban districts as the cost of health care.
   1. The district is currently paying nearly $5,000 per student for health care costs as compared to the total cost per pupil in 2013 of $16,493.
   2. The district’s health care consultant told the treasurer that the district has the highest health care costs per plan of any district in Ohio.
C. The treasurer is beginning discussions with the bargaining units to see what can be done to bring these costs down.
D. A written analysis is in process.

IV. Continue implementing changes in the design of accounting systems and work flow and checks and balances in an effort to improve internal control to help catch and correct errors and improve communication. Provide accounting staff with training as changes are made to operating procedures. (p. 16)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”
B. The treasurer is in the planning/implementation stage for the Plante Moran recommendations. Completion of the Plante Moran report recommendations will satisfy this recommendation.
C. The treasurer has already begun implementation of the following two recommendations:
   1. Realignment of purchase order and accounts payable duties from the business office to the treasurer’s office; and
   2. Realignment of payroll operations into specialized areas of certificated and non-certificated staff.
D. The treasurer is engaging an outside consultant to provide training for payroll and accounts payable staff.
V. Prepare an analysis for Fund 34 on an annual basis and determine if and when required resources will be insufficient to meet the district’s capital improvements plan. Prepare a menu of options to address under-funded or unfunded capital improvement needs and present those options to the board of education and the Youngstown Academic Distress Commission. (p. 16)

A. The status of this recommendation is “Not in Progress.”

B. The district is aware that funding is insufficient to provide for long-term needs, when a significant portion of buildings and equipment begin to fail and need to be replaced.

VI. Continue recent school choice options but prepare a cost benefit analysis to assure that funding for those options does not force the district into fiscal distress. (p. 16)

A. The status of this recommendation is “In Progress.”

B. The treasurer expressed concern regarding fundamental problems with determining the benefit/value of a program as part of a cost benefit analysis.
Appendix A: Review Team Members, Activities, Site Visit Schedule

Review Team Members
The following team of Ohio Department of Education staff members and independent consultants conducted the review at Youngstown City School District Nov. 19-21, 2014.

1. Abby L. Dewar, Leadership, Governance and Communication
2. Bernadine Burchett, Curriculum and Instruction
3. Connie Solano, Assessment and Effective Use of Data
5. Dr. Phillip J. Latessa, Student Supports
6. Dennis Dorsey, Human Resources and Professional Development
7. Dr. John Richard, Associate Superintendent
8. Clairie Huff-Franklin, Director, Distress Commissions and Education Reform

District Review Activities
The following activities were conducted during the review:

Interviews
- District Superintendent
- District Deputy Superintendent
- District Assistant Superintendent
- District Treasurer
- Chief of Business
- Public Relations Director
- Youngstown Board of Education President
- Private Consultant for Youngstown Administrators and Board of Education Members
- Technology Director
- EMIS and Testing Coordinator
- Special Education Director
- Building Coaches
- Curriculum Director
- Curriculum Specialists
- ESL Coordinator
- State Support Team Consultants

Focus Groups
- Parent and Parent Liaison Focus Group
- Student Focus Group
- Teacher Focus Group
- Quaglia Focus Group
- New Administrators Focus Group

Onsite Visits
1. Martin Luther King Elementary
2. McGuffey Elementary
3. Paul Bunn Elementary
4. Williamson Elementary
5. Chaney Campus  
6. Choffin Career Center  
7. East Campus  
8. Youngstown Early College  
9. Programs of Promise at Wilson  
10. Rayen Early College  
11. Discovery Program at Kirkmere  
12. Discovery Program at Volney  
13. Discovery Program at East
### Mid-year Site Review Schedule

#### November 19-21, 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Wednesday 11/18</th>
<th>Thursday 11/19</th>
<th>Friday 11/21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 8:30 -9:30 a.m.  | Special Education Director                         | 1) Executive Director of Teaching and Learning  
2) Chief of Maintenance and Business Affairs  
3) Director of Communications and Public Relations; | New Administrator Focus Group                                                   |
| 9:30-10:30 a.m.  | 1) Assistant Superintendent, Human Resources  
2) EMIS & Testing; Student Services  
3) Math & Literacy Coaches | 1) Newly Hired Teachers  
2) State/Federal Programs  
3) Curriculum Specialists | 1) State Support Team Five  
2) Consultants  
3) Technology Director |
| 10:00-11:30 a.m. | District Treasurer                                   | Board of Education President                                                  | Building Visits  
Programs of Promise at Wilson  
Discovery Program at Kirkmere |
| 10:30-11:30 a.m. | 1) Deputy Superintendent of Academic Affairs  
2) EMIS & Testing | District Leadership Team Cancelled  
(District thought this was Administrative Team.) | Building Visits  
Programs of Promise at Wilson  
Discovery Program at Kirkmere |
| Noon             | Lunch                                               | Building Visits:  
Williamson  
Chaney  
Choffin Career  
East Campus  
Youngstown Early College |                                                   |
| 12:30-3:30 p.m.  | Building Visits:  
Taft  
Harding  
MLKing  
McGuffey  
Bunn | Building Visits:  
Williamson  
Chaney  
Choffin Career  
East Campus  
Youngstown Early College | Discovery Program at Volney;  
Discovery Program at East; Rayen Early College |
| 2:30-3:30 p.m.   | Student Focus Group                                 |                                                                                | 2:30-4:00pm DRT  
Debrief at Mahoning County ESC |
| 3:30-5 p.m.      | 1) Student Services  
2) Superintendent  
3) Teacher Focus Group | 3:30 -4:30 p.m.  
Quaglia Teams  
3:30-5 p.m.  
Parent Focus Group | School visit on Wed. |
Appendix B: Enrollment, Expenditures, Performance

Figure 1: YCSD Enrollment Trend

Figure 2: YCSD Enrollment by Subgroup (Race)
Figure 7: YCSD 2013-2014 Reading Performance Comparisons by Grade Level

Figure 8: YCSD Reading OAA and OGT Passing Rates by Grade Level
Figure 9: YCSD Fall 2014 Reading OAA Value-Added Report

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth Standard</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State 3-Yr-Avg</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>-0.0</td>
<td>-0.4</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012 Mean NCE Gain</td>
<td>3.6 DG</td>
<td>-0.3 Y</td>
<td>-1.7 R</td>
<td>-2.8 R</td>
<td>-3.6 R</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std Error</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013 Mean NCE Gain</td>
<td>-1.0 O</td>
<td>-2.1 R</td>
<td>-5.3 R</td>
<td>-2.0 R</td>
<td>-0.0 Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std Error</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014 Mean NCE Gain</td>
<td>2.4 DG</td>
<td>0.6 Y</td>
<td>1.4 LG</td>
<td>-1.9 R</td>
<td>-0.7 Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std Error</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-Yr-Avg NCE Gain</td>
<td>1.7 DG</td>
<td>-0.8 O</td>
<td>-1.8 R</td>
<td>-2.2 R</td>
<td>-1.4 R</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std Error</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **DG**: Estimated mean NCE gain is greater than the growth standard by at least 2 standard errors.
- **LG**: Estimated mean NCE gain is above the growth standard by at least 1 standard error but less than 2 standard errors above it.
- **Y**: Estimated mean NCE gain is at most 1 standard error below the growth standard but less than 1 standard error above it.
- **O**: Estimated mean NCE gain is more than 1 standard error below the growth standard but by 2 standard errors or less.
- **R**: Estimated mean NCE gain is below the growth standard by more than 2 standard errors.

Figure 10: YCSD 2013-2014 Math Performance Comparisons by Grade Level

- **YSCD**
- **Similar Districts**
- **State**

Comparison of math performance by grade level for YCSD, Similar Districts, and State.
Figure 11: YCSD Math OAA and OGT Passing Rates by Grade Level

Figure 12: YCSD Fall 2014 Math OAA Value-Added Report

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Growth Standard</th>
<th>State 3-Yr-Avg</th>
<th>2012 Mean NCE Gain</th>
<th>2013 Mean NCE Gain</th>
<th>2014 Mean NCE Gain</th>
<th>3-Yr-Avg NCE Gain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>DG</td>
<td>DG</td>
<td>DG</td>
<td>DG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>3.7 DG</td>
<td>-1.2 O</td>
<td>-2.8 R</td>
<td>-0.1 Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
<td>-1.0 O</td>
<td>1.8 DG</td>
<td>-0.8 O</td>
<td>-0.0 Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>-0.3</td>
<td>-3.6 R</td>
<td>-4.2 R</td>
<td>-0.6 R</td>
<td>-0.6 Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.1 LG</td>
<td>0.8 LG</td>
<td>0.8 LG</td>
<td>0.3 Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>-0.3</td>
<td>-0.3 Y</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>-1.4 R</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>-0.5 O</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>-0.5 O</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DG** Estimated mean NCE gain is greater than the growth standard by at least 2 standard errors.

**LG** Estimated mean NCE gain is above the growth standard by at least 1 standard error but less than 2 standard errors above it.

**Y** Estimated mean NCE gain is at most 1 standard error below the growth standard but less than 1 standard error above it.

**O** Estimated mean NCE gain is more than 1 standard error below the growth standard but by 2 standard errors or less.

**R** Estimated mean NCE gain is below the growth standard by more than 2 standard errors.
Figure 13: YCSD Performance Index Trend

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Untested</th>
<th>Limited</th>
<th>Basic</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Accelerated</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>17.8</td>
<td>32.6</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>16.6</td>
<td>33.5</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Score = 73.7  Total Score = 76.9  Total Score = 77.7

Figure 14: YCSD Graduation Rate Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>YCSD</th>
<th>Similar Districts</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4-Year</td>
<td>69.2%</td>
<td>75.3%</td>
<td>82.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-Year</td>
<td>73.8%</td>
<td>79.8%</td>
<td>83.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 15: YCSD Graduation Cohort Rates

Figure 16: YCSD Number of Drop-outs by Grade and Year
### Table 1: Youngstown City SD Teacher Demographic Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Teacher Average Salary</th>
<th>Teacher Median Salary</th>
<th>% Core Courses Taught by Highly Qualified Teachers</th>
<th>Teacher Attendance</th>
<th>% of Teachers with Masters or Doctorate Degrees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>$50,661</td>
<td>$52,616</td>
<td>96.0%</td>
<td>94.8%</td>
<td>55.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-2012</td>
<td>$51,539</td>
<td>$53,142</td>
<td>98.6%</td>
<td>93.3%</td>
<td>54.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-2013</td>
<td>$52,528</td>
<td>$54,869</td>
<td>99.1%</td>
<td>93.5%</td>
<td>55.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-2014</td>
<td>$52,974</td>
<td>$55,113</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>92.5%</td>
<td>53.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2: 2013-2014 Youngstown City SD School Enrollment by Race and Special Populations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Building</th>
<th>Total Number of Students by Race</th>
<th>Total Number of Students by Special Populations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>African American</td>
<td>Hispanic/ Latino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaney Campus VPA &amp; STEM</td>
<td>418</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choffin Career Center</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East High School</td>
<td>961</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harding Elementary School</td>
<td>332</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M L King Elementary School</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul C Bunn Elementary School</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rayen Early College</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taft Elementary School</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Holmes McGuffey Elementary School</td>
<td>372</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Williamson Elementary School</td>
<td>329</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown Early College</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown Virtual Academy</td>
<td>28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3: Youngstown City SD Discipline Occurrences (District Level)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline Reason</th>
<th>2011-2012 School Year</th>
<th>2012-2013 School Year</th>
<th>2013-2014 School Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Out of School Suspension</td>
<td>In School Suspension</td>
<td>Emergency removal by district personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Truancy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fighting/Violence</td>
<td>642</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vandalism</td>
<td>34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theft</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use/Possession of weapon other than gun/explosive</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use/Possession of tobacco</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use/Possession of other drugs</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disobedient/Disruptive Behavior</td>
<td>2256</td>
<td>3541</td>
<td>415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harassment/Intimidation</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unwelcome Sexual Conduct</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firearm Look-a-likes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unwelcome Sexual Conduct</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4: Youngstown City SD Out of School Suspensions per 100 Students (Building Level)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building</th>
<th>2011-2012</th>
<th>2012-2013</th>
<th>2013-2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chaney Campus VPA &amp; STEM</td>
<td>39.6</td>
<td>42.6</td>
<td>46.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choffin Career Center</td>
<td>27.2</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East High School</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>101.5</td>
<td>76.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harding Elementary School</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>22.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirkmere Elementary School</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M L King Elementary School</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P. Ross Berry 8th Grade Academy</td>
<td>165.6</td>
<td>162.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul C Bunn Elementary School</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rayen Early College</td>
<td>39.6</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>17.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taft Elementary School</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University Project Learning Center</td>
<td>263.2</td>
<td>345.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volney Rogers Middle School</td>
<td>107.0</td>
<td>99.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Holmes McGuffey Elementary School</td>
<td>34.0</td>
<td>23.0</td>
<td>33.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Williamson Elementary School</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>22.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wilson Middle School</td>
<td>109.0</td>
<td>46.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown Early College</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown Virtual Academy</td>
<td>39.7</td>
<td>46.6</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C: List of Documents Reviewed

1. ADC Agendas and Minutes
2. Agendas of YCSD schools (randomly selected)
3. Approved Academic Distress Commission Youngstown Academic Recovery Plan
4. Assessment and Use of Data Training Schedule and Feedback Assessment
5. Board meetings Spreadsheet
6. Board of Education Agendas and Minutes
7. Calendar of assessment testing dates Assessment
8. Community Survey draft
9. Curriculum Guides
10. Curriculum Maps
11. District Curriculum Programs Monitoring Protocols
12. District developed assessments - samples
13. District Report Card
14. District Website
15. DLT, BLT and TBT meeting agendas
16. DLT, BLT and TBT meeting minutes
17. Documents from the Ohio 8 Urban Conference
18. Evaluations and Action Plans of participants
19. Fund 34 Fiscal Management FM 01 Fund 34
20. Fund 34 Fiscal Management FM 01a Plan to review 34
21. Handbook of current building employees and licensures
22. Individual building plans - drafts
23. Marketing Plan for Youngstown City Schools (rough draft)
24. Meeting agendas and minutes
25. Memos/Directives to members
26. Memos/Invitations/Agendas of Retreats
27. Needs Assessment of Positive Student Support Team Procedures Survey
28. News Releases of district testing
29. One Plans for buildings
30. OPES and OTES Notebooks
31. PBIS Development Meeting (October, 28)
32. PBIS Fact Sheet
33. PBIS Meeting Sign-in Sheet
34. Plan to collect data to measure student outcomes
35. Positive Student Support Team Referral Packet
36. Press releases for the Youngstown Vindicator
37. Principal/Administrator Retreat
38. Principals Professional Development Plan Team
39. Procedural calendars
40. Project Aspire Certificate
41. Proposed draft of revised Positive Student Support Team
42. Quaglia Aspirations Year 3 of Demonstration Project plan
43. Quarterly benchmarks Curriculum and Instruction - samples
44. Required reports to document interventions and monitor students
45. Strategies to fix short fall in fund 34 Fiscal Management FM 01b Short Fall
46. Student Quaglia team rosters
47. Student Services Manual
48. Supervisory directives/checklists on goals of the building level programs
49. Technology Plan
50. Timeline for revised One Plan
51. Training agendas/calendars for 2013-14 and 2014-15
52. Triangulation of district programs to Ohio’s New Learning Standards
53. Updated list of school choice options for all students
54. Videos on district testing/learning program
55. Weekly Friday Notes from Dr. Hathorn
56. Various Grant Files
57. Various Transportation Reports
58. Williamson School One Plan
59. Williamson School TBT minutes
60. Youngstown Academic Plan
62. Youngstown City Schools Instructional System Framework
63. Youngstown City School District Revitalization Plan power point, no date
64. Youngstown City Schools “One Plan” October 2013
65. Youngstown District Curriculum Maps
66. Youngstown District Pacing Guides
68. Youngstown Program of Study
69. Youngstown Staff Personnel Files